



# Innovations in service delivery

## International experience in low-density countries

Victoria Chambers, Leni Wild and Marta Foresti

### Key messages

- Delivering services in areas of low population density, particularly where there has been conflict or insecurity, and with diverse and nomadic populations, can pose significant challenges.
- One obstacle to overcome is the prevalence of hard-to-reach populations living in physically remote areas; more fundamentally, the state may be seen as absent or remote, reinforcing a lack of trust and undermining state–community relations.
- To explore these issues, and to inform programming in Mali and the Sahel region, this report reviews international experience across a range of sectors, to identify innovations in the delivery of services.
- It finds that innovative approaches often involve some key features, namely: greater *mobility* of providers and service points, greater *connectivity* between providers and users, take the form of *practical hybrids*, and allow space for *conflict resolution and mediation*. These services can be delivered through a diverse set of governance arrangements, and not necessarily through the government or through decentralised structures.

---

# Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank Asbjorn Wee, Julia Lendorfer, Charlotte Yaiche and Alexandre Marc at the World Bank for their support and useful inputs for this report. We would also like to thank Andy Norton, Francesca Bastagli, Bryn Welham, Rebecca Simpson, Sara Pantuliano, Richard Mallet and other colleagues at ODI for their suggestions and comments to inform earlier versions of this report, and to Deborah Eade for her copy-editing of the text. All errors and omissions, however, are the responsibility of the authors.

---

# Table of contents

<b>Acknowledgements</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>Abbreviations</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>Executive summary</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2 Identifying innovation: Methodology and key contextual factors</b>	<b>2</b>
2.1 Key definitions	2
2.2 Methodology and evidence base	4
<b>3 Lessons from international experience</b>	<b>6</b>
3.1 Mobility and adaptability of service delivery processes	7
3.2 Greater connectivity through use of ICTs	11
3.3 Hybrid arrangements for service delivery	16
3.4 Delivering services in the context of sub-national conflict	20
<b>4 Building an enabling environment</b>	<b>28</b>
4.1 Governance models for service delivery	28
4.2 Targeting remote or marginalised areas	32
4.3 Regional and sub-regional approaches	34
<b>5 Conclusions</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>References</b>	<b>40</b>
<b>Appendix 1: Matrix of countries for selection</b>	<b>46</b>
<b>Appendix 2: List of examples</b>	<b>47</b>
<b>Tables</b>	
<b>Table 1: Key innovation features</b>	<b>38</b>
<b>Boxes</b>	
Box 1: Nomadic Skills Training and Vocational Education Project in northern Nigeria.....	8
Box 2: Rural Development Campaign in Somalia .....	8
Box 3: Inter-sectoral School Health and Nutrition Project, Eritrea.....	9
Summary I: Relevance of these examples for the Sahel region and Northern Mali.....	11
Box 5: Distance learning in Kenya .....	12
Box 6: Rural in Reach Programme in Western Australia.....	12
Box 7: MPesa in Kenya .....	13

---

Box 8: Mobile Doctors Network in Ghana .....	14
Summary II: Relevance for the Sahel region and Northern Mali .....	16
Box 10: Franco-Arab, Islamic and madrassa schools in Niger and Mali .....	17
Box 11: Aboriginal Head Start on Reserve in Canada .....	18
Summary III: Relevance for the Sahel region and Northern Mali .....	20
Box 13: National Solidarity Programme in Afghanistan .....	21
Summary VI: Relevance for the Sahel region and Northern Mali .....	26
Box 15: Anglophone and Francophone definitions of decentralisation .....	29
Box 16: Examples of asymmetric decentralisation .....	30
Box 17: Equalisation transfers .....	31
Box 18: Output-based sectoral grants .....	31
Box 19: Cash-transfer programmes in conflict-affected countries.....	33

---

# Abbreviations

AFD	Agence Française de Développement (French Development Agency)
AIDS	Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
ALCO	Abidjan-Lagos Corridor
ARTF	Afghanistan Reconstruction Trust Fund
ART	Anti-Retroviral Therapy
CAHW	Community Animal Health Worker
CBO	Community-based organisation
CCT	Conditional cash transfer
CDC	Community Development Committees
CDD	Community-Driven Development
CEN-SAD	Community of Sahel-Saharan States
CHW	Community health worker
CILLS	Comité permanent Inter-États de Lutte contre la Sécheresse (Permanent Interstate Committee for Drought Control in the Sahel)
DRC	Democratic Republic of the Congo
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African States
FAO	Food and Agricultural Organization of the United Nations
HERB	Health Education Reaching Blokes
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
ILRI	International Livestock Research Institute
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
IRC	International Rescue Committee

---

Km	kilometre
km <sup>2</sup>	square kilometre
MARWOPNET	Mano River Women’s Peace Network
MDNet	Mobile Doctors Network
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
ODI	Overseas Development Institute
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PDA	Personal Digital Assistant
PEPFAR	US President’s Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief
PPP	Public–Private Partnership
RCMP	Royal Canadian Mounted Police
RCT	Randomised Control Trials
SIM	Subscriber Identity Module (for use in mobile phones)
SMS	Short Message Service
ToR	Terms of Reference
USA	United States of America
WAEMU	West Africa Economic and Monetary Union
WHO	World Health Organization

---

# Executive summary

Delivering government services in areas of low population density, particularly where there has been experience of conflict or insecurity, and where there may be diverse and nomadic populations, can pose significant challenges. One such obstacle is the high prevalence of hard-to-reach populations living in physically remote areas. More fundamentally, in many of these contexts the state is either absent or perceived as remote, and this in turn can reinforce a sense of mistrust and undermine state–community relations. This means that approaches to delivering services in low-density areas require a combination of innovative features to address a broad range of challenges. To explore these issues, the World Bank commissioned the Overseas Development Institute (ODI) to conduct an international review of innovative service-delivery approaches. It is hoped that this review will help to inform programming in Mali and the Sahel region.

This review highlights a range of these innovative approaches to delivering services in low-density areas, with an emphasis on ensuring a positive state presence, improving the interface between service providers and local populations, and contributing to improved trust. We recognise that concepts such as ‘trust’ defy simple definition. The review draws on two distinct dimensions: first, trust can be linked to the state’s increased and positive visibility and/or by a perceived increase in the legitimacy of its functions (McLoughlin 2013; Wild and Mason 2012); second, trust can be linked to how far the way in which services are delivered facilitates meaningful interactions between citizens and providers and helps them collectively to resolve problems that would otherwise impede delivery (Booth 2012).

We therefore refer to service-delivery approaches that have in some way attempted to address particular contextual features (i.e. low-density populations, socio-economic diversity, and insecurity) while at the same time helping to build a level of trust. The review identified a matrix of countries with similar levels of low-density populations (within a pre-determined range) and sought contexts that were also affected by conflict or had nomadic, indigenous, or socio-economically diverse populations. These criteria allowed us to look at a broad range of experiences in countries including Afghanistan, Kenya, Niger and Pakistan, as well as Australia and Canada, and to identify a range of programming choices and some key features of innovation.

Although some of these innovative features are generic and potentially applicable to a range of contexts and sectors, others are very specific and have not been scaled up beyond a specific project or location. We thus emphasise caution in seeking to draw general lessons from individual examples. An important finding of this review is that innovations to provide services in areas of low density, conflict, and socio-economic diversity exhibit diverse and varied sets of governance arrangements. These arrangements depend on the specific contexts and settings, and may not always work through the government.

Nonetheless, there are some core features of innovative practice for delivering services in low-density areas – namely the ability to establish mobile services, the potential for greater connectivity (including through the adoption of Information and Communication Technology

---

(ICT)), the use of practical hybrids and processes of reconciliation and reconstruction linked to conflict. All of these take place within a set of options regarding the governance and financing of delivering services to remote areas.

Turning first to the mobility and adaptability of service-delivery processes, there has been a range of efforts to provide more physically mobile services, often aimed at hard-to-reach groups or specific needs. Such efforts recognise that it is often not practical or feasible to provide the full range of services in low-density areas, which calls for choices about which services to make more mobile. Examples include mobile health units and mobile schools. Such initiatives depend on a certain level of infrastructure (such as accessible roads and adequate vehicles). Other options include the co-provision of services, such as using schools as locations to provide health services, or the training of community members (including community health workers, CHWs) to strengthen proximity to communities.

Connectivity among providers and between users, particularly through the use of ICTs, has also been valuable in improving perceptions and building greater interactions in relation to service delivery. These approaches may be most useful where greater physical mobility is not possible – for instance, ICTs can support communications between health workers and patients (achieved through mobile phones in Kenya) or to facilitate farmers' access to real-time information on market prices, as is the case in Niger. There have also been significant advances in mobile banking, which facilitates the capacity of diaspora associations to complement the delivery of public services. Finally, ICTs can be valuable in supporting information-gathering, enabling providers to be more responsive to diverse needs. For example, CHWs in Senegal gathered and sent monthly data via mobile phone, which enabled ministry-level staff to identify (and later rectify) the lack of inexpensive facilities used to assist childbirth in rural areas. These are potentially exciting innovations, although they require significant infrastructure (e.g. mobile phone coverage, access to electricity and key hardware), and also could lead to effective public–private partnerships (PPPs).

Hybrid arrangements, involving state and non-state actors, formal and informal institutions, can be useful in adapting to local preferences and accepted ways of doing things. Examples include attempts to integrate Islamic schooling into formal education systems or hybrid arrangements for resolving disputes. These may be focused on particular groups, such as nomadic populations, to reflect their values and ways of life. So-called 'practical hybrids' will often stress the importance of collaboration and collective action, which may involve a range of authorities (often including customary authorities). Crucially, these need to build on local institutions and norms.

Processes of reconciliation and reconstruction following periods of violence and/or armed conflict are also of central importance. There is growing experience in a range of community-based mechanisms such as community-driven reconstruction efforts. These involve communities in design, planning and management, and can be particularly useful where trust is low and communities are divided – as, for example, in the National Solidarity Programme in Afghanistan. Again, these may need to build upon (or at least relate to) existing institutional arrangements and capacities, and incorporate reconciliation processes for mediating between groups. Finally, regional dynamics are significant – from pastoralists' access to natural resources to national borders and the potential for smuggling and criminal networks. These require a range of regional responses (including at the sub-regional and micro-regional level) and may include initiatives to provide alternative livelihoods.

The above examples set out some of the elements of more innovative approaches to delivering services. There remain important questions regarding the underlying governance models for service delivery. In particular the review challenges the assumptions underlying the rationale for decentralisation as a peace-building measure and questions whether decentralised provision is necessarily the most appropriate model. Evidence suggests that it is the extent and form of decentralisation, and the nature of its implementation, as well as the broader



---

governance environment, that are key determinants of how services are provided. It is critical in this regard to recognise that Francophone and Anglophone countries in Africa have different legacies and concepts of decentralisation. Forms of asymmetric decentralisation may be useful, permitting regions that have greater capacity to assume broader functions than more rural and remote areas with more limited capacity. Issues of fiscal equalisation are also important, and need to take into account the marked differences in the cost of delivering services in low-density versus higher-density settings. Experience shows the need to take account of political factors, keep formulas simple, and explore options for reaching particularly vulnerable or marginalised areas (for example through cash-transfer programmes).

Ultimately, the development of innovative and effective public services requires processes of local and national-level dialogue, and strong contextual understanding, to determine what type of state is most desirable in Mali and other countries in the Sahel, and how to best organise service-delivery processes. This process also needs to encompass reflections on regional solutions, including sub-regional and micro-regional responses. International experience can help to inform and facilitate these reflections, and it is hoped that this review offers some useful points for how to address some of the key issues facing the region.

---

# 1 Introduction

Delivering basic services in areas of low population density, particularly where there has been experience of conflict or insecurity, and where there may be diverse and nomadic populations, can pose significant challenges. There may be a need to provide more mobile services, which require different capacities and systems to conventional modes of delivery. It may also call for greater adaption and connectivity in terms of the services as such, with implications for training and skills, as well as capabilities. Such challenges arise in a number of contexts in which there have been efforts to find innovative ways to address them. Some of these have contributed to enhancing perceptions of the state and to greater trust among communities, service providers and the state. To date, however, few reviews explicitly explore this trust dimension and aggregate experience from a range of settings that can be classified as ‘low density’.

The World Bank therefore commissioned researchers at the Overseas Development Institute (ODI) to carry out an international review of innovative approaches for delivering services in areas of low population density. It is hoped that this review, and subsequent work in Mali and the Sahel region, can help to inform programming. This report sets out the main findings and insights from the review.

---

## 2 Identifying innovation: Methodology and key contextual factors

In line with the Terms of Reference (ToR), the review sought to identify innovative international experience in delivering a range of services and ensuring a positive state presence and forms of trust-building in contexts that met the following criteria:

- Low population density
- Affected by conflict or insecurity
- Socio-economic and cultural diversity of the population (including sedentary and nomadic populations)

In identifying ‘innovative approaches for delivering services and ensuring a positive presence of the state in areas of low density populations, insecurity, and socio-economic and cultural diversity of population’ (as stated in the ToR), it is important first to define some of the key concepts and terms used in developing our methodology.

### 2.1 Key definitions

**Service delivery:** This report focuses on service delivery, understood as the range of activities to ensure the provision of basic services to those who use them. Definitions of ‘basic services’, particularly of public goods and services, are widely debated. For the purposes of this review, there was interest in a wide range of sectors, namely social services (health, education, water/sanitation), governance and security, and some aspects of markets and employment. In order to ensure a range of relevant experience without compromising the depth of analysis, it was agreed that this study would focus primarily on the delivery of health and education services and clean water, as well as some aspects of security (in particular, community policing) and agricultural services.

**Areas of low population density:** The literature on low-density populations indicates the lack of universally accepted criteria for defining a country as ‘low density’, which makes it difficult to establish a benchmark figure for comparative purposes. For this review, we defined low density as countries (or regions within countries) with a population density similar to that of Mali. A ranking of countries in order of their relative population densities, by continent, was developed using the World Bank 2011 data<sup>1</sup> (Appendix 1). According to these figures, in 2011 the population density of Mali was 13 people per square kilometre (km<sup>2</sup>). In order to provide sufficient scope to identify relevant examples we defined the low-density benchmark as 30 people per km<sup>2</sup>, and focused on those countries with a population

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/EN.POP.DNST>

---

density of this level or below. However we also drew examples from low density regions within countries with higher average population densities where these were relevant.

**Areas of insecurity:** Security and insecurity are contested concepts for which there are no universal definitions. We therefore decided to use the World Bank's 2013 list of (International Development Association-eligible) 'fragile and conflict affected situations' as our point of departure for identifying countries of potential interest. It was noted, however, that this list might ignore countries in which there were regional pockets of insecurity. A number of countries currently experiencing internal conflicts and security issues, which exhibit similar characteristics to Northern Mali (i.e. they are located within the Sahel region, have remote or isolated northern communities, and nomadic populations) – such as Mali, Niger and Nigeria – were thus also prioritised.

**Socio-economic and cultural diversity** refers to a situation in which different economic and social groups co-exist in the same geographical space. For the purposes of the review we defined socio-economic and cultural diversity as the co-existence of different groups within the same country, whose different identities and lifestyles mean they may have different service-delivery needs and different relations with – and perceptions of – the state. In line with the ToR, we identified nomadic<sup>2</sup> populations as a socio-economic group of specific interest. The presence of indigenous and ethnically diverse populations was identified as a second-level priority.

**Trust building:** The review aims to highlight innovative approaches for delivering basic services which ensure a positive presence of the state, with a focus on those that have improved the interface between providers and local populations, and thus contributed to improved trust and satisfaction. The concept of 'trust' is, however, notoriously difficult to define, and there is a limited and patchy evidence base on which to draw. For the purposes of the review, we identified two distinct dimensions.

The first relates to the interaction between the delivery of basic services and the role and presence of the state. In this case, it is believed that trust is linked to an increased and positive visibility of the state and/or to a perceived increase in the legitimacy of its functions (McLoughlin 2013; Wild and Mason 2012).

The second dimension relates to the extent to which service delivery is facilitated by the capacity for collective action and local problem-solving. In this case trust is linked to the extent to which service delivery facilitates meaningful interactions between citizens and providers to help them collectively to resolve problems that would otherwise impede service delivery. This draws from evidence that a key component of state–society relationships is the ability to identify collective interests and to work together to achieve them, even in contexts of diversity (Booth 2012).

We therefore define 'trust'-building as interventions that either positively build the visibility of the state in some fashion (including in sometimes unintended ways) or which support the capacity for collective action (particularly at the local level, which we refer to as local problem-solving).

**Defining innovation:** We defined 'innovations' (or innovative examples) as attempts to provide basic services to populations, or overcome barriers to service delivery, in ways that meet the contextual factors defined above (i.e. low population density, socio-economic diversity and insecurity). Innovations therefore refer to service-delivery approaches that have

---

<sup>2</sup> Nomadic populations move (periodically or cyclically) from one place to another rather than settling. There are three types of nomads: hunter-gathers (who harvest seasonally available wild plants and game), peripatetic nomads (who travel from place to place offering a trade) and pastoralists (who raise herds of livestock and move with them to optimise the use of natural resources). There are two main sub-groups of mobile pastoralists: nomadic (who are opportunistic and follow resources in a pattern that varies from year to year) and transhumant (who move herds between fixed points to exploit seasonal availability of resources and often have a permanent homestead).

---

in some way attempted to address these particular contextual features while at the same time supporting some form of trust-building.

It is important to note that we could not validate the extent to which these examples achieved significant impact in the delivery of services as such. This reflects a lack of available evidence on impact and also the limitations of a desk review, which meant that we were unable to verify some studies. The review therefore adopted a narrower focus on innovations as attempts to reach and build trust with particular groups, rather than making broader assumptions about the overall effectiveness of service delivery, although evidence on impact and results is also included where possible.

## 2.2 Methodology and evidence base

The review drew on international experience from a range of sectors to explore innovative contemporary and historical experiences in service delivery. Although the approach is not primarily sectoral, to refine the scope of the review we focused on a number of key sectors, notably health, education, water and some aspects of security and justice (i.e. community policing).

The process of selecting relevant examples was two-fold. First, we identified a matrix of countries from which innovative examples could be drawn (see Appendix 1). Based on the definitions noted above, the selected countries/regions were required to have a low population density and be either affected by conflict or insecurity and/or have nomadic, indigenous or ethnically diverse populations. Furthermore, to ensure that the innovations identified were relevant to the Sahel region, we gave priority to examples drawn from North and sub-Saharan African countries, along with other examples that met our criteria (i.e. Australia, Canada and Mongolia).

Following this selection process, a preliminary list of innovative examples was drawn up. This list provided innovative examples of programmes that attempt to deliver services in ways that address the contextual features outlined above and at the same time support some level of trust-building between groups.

The long-list of examples permitted a first round of reflection on several issues:

- First, the review highlighted that trust has been recorded as either an explicit outcome of particular initiatives or as an intended outcome of the project/intervention.
- Second, the examples drew heavily on project activities. Following feedback from the World Bank, it was agreed in drawing up the shortlist we should also try to draw on experience in building broader systems and processes, for instance in relation to decentralisation or budget and planning processes. To address this, the long-list was refined to focus on those project activities that could be or had been scaled up rather than on pilot or stand-alone projects, and an additional section was added to summarise experience in broader systems and processes for low-density populations (with a focus on capturing recent practice but a less explicit focus on identifying innovations).

A shorter list of priority examples was therefore drawn up, alongside some additional literature, to meet the following criteria:

- Examples of innovations that are either (a) project activities that have been scaled up and/or (b) are part of a broader strategy/plan (policies, approaches).
- Examples of innovations that have resulted in greater trust either as (a) an outcome or (b) where achieving greater trust is an explicit component of the design process.

---

Attention was also paid to issues of cost effectiveness and sustainability, where there was available evidence. For instance, interventions using ICTs were particularly considered, including ‘low technologies’ such as mobile phones and radio.

Finally, this review was desk-based and drew on evidence from a number of sources. The innovative examples were drawn from published studies, grey literature, evaluations and academic literature, while the fourth section draws on a slightly wider academic literature and evidence base. Although there were benefits to drawing on a varied evidence base, it is important to note some of the limitations. First, this was not a systematic review and did not seek to look comprehensively at experiences in given sectors or countries; it was necessarily selective, seeking to provide useful illustrations rather than a comprehensive review. Second, it drew on a number of evaluations and grey literature produced by organisations seeking to highlight their successes, and it was rarely possible to triangulate or evaluate this evidence, particularly with respect to claims on the impact on trust of specific interventions. It is therefore important to view the innovations cited in this review in the context in which they were selected, i.e. as examples of where there has been an attempt to reach otherwise marginalised populations to offer basic services through innovative practice, and in ways which increase trust. It was beyond the scope of the review, however, to assess the results of specific innovations in terms of the effective reach or quality of services.

---

## 3 Lessons from international experience

This section highlights a range of innovative practices and experiences in delivering services in low-density contexts, and in ways that attempt to build greater trust between citizens and the state. It reviews more than 55 examples of service-delivery programmes in a wide range of low-density contexts and across different sectors (including, as stated earlier, education, health, water and sanitation, security/policing, livelihoods and agriculture). As set out in the previous section, we specifically focused on examples addressing at least one the following key problems/issues:

- Nomadic or mobile populations
- Populations with indigenous, ethnic or religious diversity
- Conflict-affected populations, including a range of conflict patterns, from sub-national to regional.

A matrix summarising such examples is given in Appendix 2, including a breakdown by sectors, countries and principal contextual features.

Overall, this review suggests that the provision of services in low-density and remote areas poses some key challenges for establishing appropriate delivery mechanisms and systems. Some of these are largely related to the practical obstacles posed by a high prevalence of hard-to-reach populations in physically remote areas. It is also important to recognise the existence of other challenges: for example, in many of these contexts, the state is either absent or seen as remote, which can reinforce a sense of mistrust or undermine state–community relations. In practice this implies that approaches to delivering services in low-density areas need to combine various innovative features in order to address a broad range of challenges.

Despite these differences, our analysis identified a core set of innovative features aimed at addressing the dynamics of service delivery in low-density areas. While some of the examples are generic in nature and potentially applicable to a range of different contexts and sectors, others are very specific and have not been scaled up beyond a specific project or location. It is important, therefore, to exercise caution in seeking to draw general lessons from individual examples. Nonetheless, the core features of innovative practice for service delivery in low-density areas identified are:

- Mobility and adaptability of service-delivery processes, including efforts to ensure more physically mobile services, often focused on particularly hard-to-reach groups or specific health needs
- Connectivity among providers and among users, providers and policy-makers (particularly through the use of ICTs), to improve perceptions and build greater interactions in relation to service delivery

- Hybrid arrangements, involving state and non-state actors, formal and informal institutions and rules, to adapt to local preferences and accepted ways of doing things
- Processes of reconciliation and reconstruction following periods of violence and/or armed conflict

Each of these features is considered in the sections below, with reference to how examples of innovative arrangements have worked in practice across a range of sectors and contexts. The relevance of these examples for the Sahel region and Northern Mali is assessed and discussed at the end of each section.

### 3.1 Mobility and adaptability of service delivery processes

By definition, regions characterised by low population density have dispersed and remote communities, so it is often not feasible to maintain a full network of services, such as establishing health clinics and schools in each community. Given that the distances that some people would have to travel to obtain access to such services may limit them from doing so, there have been efforts to develop more mobile service-delivery mechanisms. Such approaches may also recognise that certain populations may be disadvantaged because of their remoteness or particular features of their way of life, and that this can reinforce their marginalisation. In addition there have been efforts to adapt the nature of the services in order to tailor the types of services offered to the specific needs of low-density populations. Looking at how these have developed in different sectors provides some useful insights into the range of service-delivery options in the Sahel region and the conditions needed to ensure these are effective.

Turning first to the physical mobility of services, these include examples such as flying doctors, mobile health units/dispensaries, community health workers (CHWs), para-veterinary professionals (para-vets) and single-teacher/mobile schools. The key features are that they provide peripatetic staff (such as teachers, health workers, or para-vets) and/or mobile units (such as dispensaries or schools) that can target hard-to-reach groups and take services to particular communities. This can make the service providers more visible and, over time, encourage greater interaction and trust between users and providers. It may not always be cost-effective to provide fully mobile services, however, especially where these need to cover significant distances. Where mobile provision has been introduced, it has often aimed to focus on a particular gap or area of marginalisation rather than providing a full spectrum of services.

For example, state and non-state actors have used mobile schools to deliver educational services to isolated communities – in particular those whose livelihoods depend on pastoral methods of production. The formal organisation and delivery of services has traditionally been provided to settled populations, through fixed infrastructure with multiple staff and in locations where there is a sufficient demand to make services viable and cost-efficient. In a number of countries, this has often contributed to making it hard or impossible for nomadic communities to obtain access to services and to perceptions of marginalisation and distrust.

Many different forms of mobile schooling have been tried, including tent-schools, schools on wheels, and various kinds of collapsible schools. While these are generally perceived not to have met expectations, typically facing problems of quality and sustainability (Krätli 2013; Hesse et al. 2013), there are some examples of successful innovative practice.

For instance, in Mongolia, where most people are pastoralists, tent-schools and/or the use of cars as mobile training centres have had some level of success. The key elements of their effectiveness appear to have been compulsory school attendance, supported by effective enforcement, and the fact that teachers were also part of the nomadic community and received regular government salaries (Krätli 2001). Similarly in Kenya, one effective initiative has been the creation of boarding schools deep within nomadic regions – such as the SAKA in



---

Kenya's North Eastern Province – run primarily by the communities (Kelleher 2007). Another useful example is the Nomadic Skills Training and Vocational Education Project (STVEP) in northern Nigeria (Box 1).

### **Box 1: Nomadic Skills Training and Vocational Education Project in northern Nigeria**

In response to the limited uptake of boarding schools and the limited success of mobile schooling in northern Nigeria, the government established the Nomadic Skills Training and Vocational Education Project (STVEP). This built 258 schools, and registered students could attend a school in one area for a number of months and then to move to another site, as their family group migrated. The schools taught a mix of formal skills such as literacy alongside more informal skills such as maintaining traditional ways of life, to avoid alienating parents and to adapt to the needs of the communities. Vocational training for adults was also provided in nomadic pastoral trades such as sewing and dairy production and used suitable methods, including radio. Furthermore, after identifying the lack of teachers as a key obstacle to nomadic schooling, the government increased its focus on training teachers and health workers from nomadic communities. This was accompanied by complementary incentives for teachers, including improvements in their living conditions and the provision of adequate accommodation.

*Source: Kelleher 2007*

There have also been efforts to adapt the curriculum and teaching methods to nomadic populations. For instance, one of the most successful examples to date of mobile schooling for nomadic populations is Somalia's literacy drive in the early 1970s (see Box 2).

### **Box 2: Rural Development Campaign in Somalia**

In its Rural Development Campaign (RDC), the Government of Somalia enrolled 20,000 urban secondary school students as literacy teachers, who were required to attach themselves to nomadic groups for a year. In less than 12 months, more than one million pastoralists had attended classes and, despite a severe famine, nearly 900,000 successfully passed the final literacy exam (Krätli 2001; UNICEF 1993). Interestingly, the effectiveness of the RDC was due in some measure to the fact that its approach and methods were based on those used in existing Qu'ranic schools, and in the packaging of its delivery. The RDC was promoted as a revival of traditional culture with the slogan 'what you know, teach, and what you do not know, learn', and this was thought to have been key in encouraging participation.

*Source: UNICEF 1993*

Experience in the health sector is instructive in that it highlights how specific health needs can be addressed through more mobile services, while still maintaining more conventional networks for primary health care.

Some approaches have targeted groups who may be much less likely to seek access to services. One such example is the 'Health Education Reaching Blokes' (HERB) initiative in Australia. This operated in Central West Queensland, a region in the outback where rural and remote communities find it difficult to obtain access to health care. Across the region, there are a number of pastoral stations for cattle rearing, in which the male lifestyles and cultural attitudes mean that men working there are much less likely to access health services. The HERB programme sought to address this by providing a mobile health unit that could travel to pastoral stations and to remote work and road crews, to screen for high-risk factors (e.g. blood pressure, sexual health, forms of cancer) and to act as a referral service. It also

---

conducted promotional activities to help dispel some of the stigmas associated with men's health.<sup>3</sup> This is a useful example of how to direct specific services, target hard-to-reach populations and take into account key community factors in designing appropriate access.

Such approaches can allow for greater access to services and can help to address perceptions of marginalisation or distance from service providers. At the same time, in both the health and education sectors, these types of service tend to be quite costly and are reliant on existing infrastructure (such as accessible roads or vehicles). They are also often subject to other socio-economic pressures which can limit their take-up – for instance, parents may be reluctant to part with their children for long periods to allow them to attend mobile schools.

More cost-effective options, which still enable the state to be more visible, can involve supporting one provider of multiple services rather than requiring separate providers and infrastructure for each service. This is illustrated in the case of the Inter-sectoral School Health and Nutrition Project in Eritrea, developed and run by the government in response to limited resources and low population density (Rodríguez Pose and Samuels 2011) (see Box 3).

### **Box 3: Inter-sectoral School Health and Nutrition Project, Eritrea**

During Eritrea's 30-year conflict with Ethiopia, there was close coordination between the health and education sectors. Following the end of armed conflict, and facing severe shortages of medical staff, the government decided to focus on schools and teachers as conduits for health services. This was formalised in 2008, as teachers were trained as health workers to improve the health of the population – particularly children's. In each school, one teacher and one director were trained and they in turn trained the rest of the teaching staff. Teachers were made responsible for the health of their pupils, monitoring their growth and development, and referring children to health centres as necessary. This programme built on historic experience in training 'barefoot doctors' to double up as teachers.

*Source: Rodríguez Pose and Samuels 2011*

Similar approaches have been adopted in various school-feeding programmes. These can be significant entry points, as in practice there may be only one point of contact (i.e. through the school). This underlines the importance of making maximum use of the institutional framework, in this case to deliver additional health and nutrition services. School feeding programmes will often train teachers in basic hygiene, nutrition and health issues and provide health and nutrition guides for schools. Some useful examples include:

- In Mauritania, which has one of the lowest average population densities in Africa, school-feeding programmes have been focused on children and families who are particularly vulnerable to food shortages and malnutrition (World Bank website).
- In South Sudan, BRAC (an NGO founded in Bangladesh) has supported a range of community schools focusing in particular on girls' education. These have also provided training in vegetable gardening and the production of sanitary napkins, as well as distributing agricultural tools and seeds. This illustrates ways in which schools can be used to deliver other services or provide other forms of information and training (BRAC 2012).

---

3

[http://www.farmerhealth.org.au/sites/default/files/Lauren\\_Chimes\\_Primary\\_healthcare\\_reaching\\_the\\_rural\\_and\\_remote\\_communities\\_Mens\\_health\\_Tuesday\\_12th\\_October\\_10.30am\\_Chimes.pdf](http://www.farmerhealth.org.au/sites/default/files/Lauren_Chimes_Primary_healthcare_reaching_the_rural_and_remote_communities_Mens_health_Tuesday_12th_October_10.30am_Chimes.pdf)

- In Pakistan, school-feeding programmes contributed to an increase in girls' enrolment, and provided them with extra take-home rations (Holmes 2010).

Beyond making services more mobile, there have been attempts to encourage greater proximity to communities, including through training and supporting community members to deliver certain services. This has been the case, for instance, in targeting specific health needs or gaps and can be useful in reaching particularly marginalised or vulnerable populations. One common approach is the use of community health facilitators who are trained to sensitise communities and provide information, but not necessarily to deliver services. There are useful examples from Nepal, Pakistan, South Sudan and Afghanistan:

- In Nepal, community facilitators worked in remote areas to build greater awareness of health issues, with a focus on maternal health. This involved training community facilitators, who then held monthly women's meetings to discuss issues concerning pregnancy and childbirth. Health services were also strengthened by ensuring supplies to local health facilities, providing neo-natal care kits and training of CHWs. These interventions were reportedly accompanied by a significant fall in perinatal and maternal mortality rates (Manandhar et al. 2004, cited in Mansuri and Rao 2012).
- In Pakistan, the government introduced the Lady Health Workers Program in 1994 and it is seen as having been effective in reducing infant mortality as well as making health workers visible at the local level (Mansuri and Rao 2012). The programme provided 15 months of training to young women with at least eight years of schooling, and who lived in the community they served. They were trained to deliver care, make home visits and allow visits in their own homes (known as a 'health home'), covering a range of needs such as antenatal care, contraceptive advice, growth monitoring and immunisation.
- In South Sudan, BRAC has trained women as community health promoters to provide basic health care and education as well as referral services. These promoters are trained to diagnose and treat some basic problems (such as diarrhoea, dysentery or anaemia), and hold regular health forums to discuss more serious illnesses such as malaria, tuberculosis and the prevention of human immunodeficiency virus (HIV). Promoters make home visits, can refer patients to the nearest government health centres, and advise on contraception methods. They earn a small income by selling over-the-counter medicines. BRAC has also organised mobile clinics in 14 remote and inaccessible areas, enabling nurses and health workers to provide basic treatment (BRAC 2012a).
- In Afghanistan, women community health promoters offered better antenatal care, raised awareness of health issues and addressed basic illnesses. BRAC worked in collaboration with the Ministry of Public Health, helping to increase health coverage in rural districts (BRAC 2012b).

Beyond health and education, other examples include efforts to provide more mobile services for livestock care in marginalised areas. A number of cases indicate that the employment of Community Animal Health Workers (CAHW) to supply para-veterinary services has helped to improve the health of livestock at the local level. CAHWs do not expect to earn the same as veterinarians and are prepared to use local transport (e.g. bicycle, pack animals, canoe and foot), which makes them more mobile. Examples include:

- In Karamoja, in northern Uganda, the use of veterinary-supervised CAHWs was an important strategic element contributing to the eradication of infectious cattle diseases such as rinderpest; CAHWs played a key role in delivering vaccines and conducting surveillance to ensure control of the disease (Cately et al. 2004).
- In north-west Kenya, pastoralist farmers ranked CAHWs as providing more affordable, accessible services with better treatment outcomes than other

modes of delivery (public, private and NGO) (Cately et al. 2004). The success factors included community involvement in the design and implementation of these systems and the involvement of the private sector in supplying and supervising CAHWs, as CAHW systems are typically delivered in collaboration with government health services, the private sector and other non-state actors. Government veterinary officers also played a strong role in training, regulating and overseeing the work of the CAHWs, underlining the importance of supervisory and regulatory frameworks for more mobile services.

### **Summary I: Relevance of these examples for the Sahel region and Northern Mali**

Mobile services may be relevant for hard-to-reach populations, in particular for nomadic and pastoralist communities, but depend upon certain infrastructure. Some of the more advanced cases discussed above require both serviceable roads and off-road vehicles, which is not the case in parts of the Sahel, where it would be necessary to consider other forms of transport (e.g. bicycles, motorbikes or pack animals). It may therefore not be tenable or cost-effective to adapt all services to provide more mobile units. It may be more viable to establish the co-provision of services, particularly in the health, education and sanitation sectors.

It may be possible to focus on specialised (programmatic) services (e.g. maternal health, vaccinations) rather than system-wide services, or on outreach to particularly vulnerable or marginalised groups (e.g. women and specifically antenatal care for pregnant women), at least for some areas. Such provision needs to be based on a sound understanding of which health needs or groups to target in order to ensure that the services are appropriately tailored. (Some of the proposals for use of ICTs in the following section may be particularly relevant.)

Many examples of more mobile and adaptive delivery of services described above need community involvement in their design and implementation, and in some cases the direct participation of community members (for instance as CHWs); the local private sector can also make important contributions. Such approaches also require strong central oversight and a regulatory framework to ensure the consistency and quality of the services provided. It is also essential to make realistic assessments of the grassroots capacity – and that of a range of non-state entities – to contribute to community outreach and mobility of services.

## **3.2 Greater connectivity through use of ICTs**

Although there is limited ability to provide services based on full physical mobility, the growing use of ICTs is bringing about improvements in virtual delivery and connectivity. This appears to be particularly promising in the fields of agriculture, markets and health. ICTs may be a useful substitute where physical mobility is particularly difficult, although their use requires significant coverage and infrastructure to be effective.

ICTs have been used to strengthen the delivery of services for remote and hard-to-reach areas in a variety of ways. They have been effective in facilitating relationships and connectivity between service providers and users. Their use has been particularly prevalent in the area of health, specifically maternal health. Examples include:

- In Ghana, basic mobile phone technology has enabled CHWs to collect patients' data and upload records to a centralised database (WHO 2011). Through the Mobile Technology for Health initiative, patients' records are analysed to establish personalised care schedules, and reminders are sent to

---

nurses and patients about health visits. Recorded messages offering advice on pregnancy-related issues, important facts about foetal development and reminders about health visits are sent to pregnant women. Providers can also maintain contact with patients, for instance concerning antenatal care or diseases such as HIV and AIDS.

- In Kenya, work funded by the US President's Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief (PEPFAR) used mobile phone communication between health workers and patients receiving antiretroviral therapy (ART) to improve adherence to the drug schedule – which it successfully did. It was also found that mobile phones could be an effective means to improve patients' health and interface with service providers (Lester et al. 2010).
- In South Africa, the MAMA South Africa programme has provided weekly health information to pregnant women.

Innovative use of ICTs (including radio and mobile phones) is also being piloted to provide distance education to children from pastoral communities, as Box 5 demonstrates. This emphasises the use of radio as part of distance learning, alongside the use of mobile phones, so that teachers can exercise oversight.

### **Box 5: Distance learning in Kenya**

In Kenya most out-of-school children live in arid or semi-arid areas dominated by the pastoral economy. Current systems are perceived as requiring children to choose between formal education and their nomadic way of life, because methods such as mobile and boarding schools are regarded as undermining children's economic and social position in pastoral livelihood systems. In response, since 2010 the Kenyan government has been piloting a distance-learning system, which relies on radio and printed materials to remove the constraint of depending upon face-to-face teaching while also employing peripatetic teachers who use mobile phones for oversight purposes.

*Source: Siele et al. 2011*

In Australia, more high-technology responses have been developed. The Rural in Reach programme,<sup>4</sup> for example, operates in the sparsely populated area of Western Australia (Reid 2013). Here, remote rural communities are too small to support traditional health services and communities rely on going to larger towns in order to obtain access to care. As a result, they are less likely to use the health services, which translates into higher health risks, undermining the continuity of care and resulting in a lack of monitoring of the effectiveness of services for those populations. In response, the programme has developed virtual linkages (Box 6).

### **Box 6: Rural in Reach Programme in Western Australia**

The Women's Health and Family Service, an NGO, developed the Rural in Reach programme, located in Perth but linked to regional women's health centres and the Western Australia Community Resource Network. It provides support to women and their families in rural and remote communities through video conferencing at participating Community Resource Centres. This provision includes referral services, access to information, counselling and support, as well as low-cost professional development and training for local health professionals. National and regional public

---

<sup>4</sup> Rural in reach website - <http://ruralinreach.whfs.org.au/>

funding was provided for the Women's Health and Family Service, and there was also the need for communications infrastructure to support video-conferencing technology. This approach was seen to be particularly useful in operating through existing Community Resource Centres, as it built capacity for these locally owned community hubs and allowed communities to have a greater say in the services they lacked access to and wanted to receive.

*Source: <http://ruralinreach.whfs.org.au/>*

Beyond health, ICTs have facilitated access to financial transactions through mobile financial applications and mobile banking systems (see Box 7). These have significantly reduced the transaction costs and risks of transferring money. For example, family members who are living in towns and cities can send money to their rural families more quickly, cheaply and safely than before.

These innovations have often provided a gateway to formal financial services and access to competitive micro-financing loans which were previously unavailable to sparse rural populations to whom it is too costly to offer traditional banking facilities. Moreover, a safe and cheap savings system, plus the simplicity of transfers, makes it easier for rural households to respond to unplanned financial demands, such as needing to pay for health care.

### **Box 7: MPesa in Kenya**

MPesa, one of the most developed mobile payment systems, was introduced in Kenya in 2007 by Safaricom and Vodafone, and by 2011 had 17 million registered users. MPesa is now working in Afghanistan, India South Africa and Tanzania, and offers its users facilities to deposit, withdraw, and transfer money, pay bills and transfer airtime (Aker and Mbiti 2010). The mobile phone operator MTN has also introduced a Mobile Money facility in 20 countries and offers similar services as well as international money transfers.

*Source: Aker and Mbiti, 2010*

The extension of these mobile banking services to international money transfers may also have implications for service delivery in remote areas, including through facilitating the capacity of diaspora associations to complement local public investment. A recent study by Chauvet et al. (2013), which examined localities in Mali between 1987 and 2009, found that those with links to a home-town association in France had more health centres, better access to clean water and a higher number of households with electricity. Removing financial barriers and costs to such transfers could potentially encourage greater use of such funds by connecting to diaspora groups, and helping to improve local services.

ICTs can also help to facilitate access to agricultural market information. Farmers' physical distance from markets means they face substantially greater search and opportunity costs than their urban counterparts in finding out about prices, jobs, and the availability of potential buyers and sellers. This puts them at a disadvantage in negotiating prices with intermediaries.

An analysis of grain markets in Niger, for example, found that an increase in mobile phone coverage between 2001 and 2006 was accompanied by a significant reduction in price variations between rural and urban markets, particularly in more remote markets where physical distance and poor roads increase transport costs (Aker 2008). Although there are low-technology alternatives, such as radio broadcasts, to inform rural consumers and farmers of market prices, the news is often out of date. Mobile phone technology offers access to real-



---

time and accurate information, allowing rural farmers in countries such as Ghana, Niger and Senegal to type in a code, send a message and immediately receive the market information they need (Aker and Mbiti 2010).

Likewise, the Grameen Foundation's Community Knowledge Initiative in Uganda employs a network of local farmers selected by their peers to share important information with their remote and isolated farming communities. These local advisers are given mobile phones through which they request and receive regular text information about issues relevant to the farming community, such as weather forecasts and farming tips. These services have enabled farmers to better plan their growing season and avoid droughts and floods, as well as providing information on how to care for crops, animals and treat pests and diseases, which helps to improve surveillance and control (Van Campenhout 2012).

The above examples focus primarily on strengthening connectivity among users, and between users and providers. This can be important for building trust and increasing visibility. ICTs have also helped to facilitate peer-to-peer links and support, which could potentially be useful for providers' based in more remote areas and could help to strengthen overall provision.

The Mobile Doctors Network in Ghana offers a useful example. Although not particularly low density, Ghana's population is dispersed mainly along its coastal borders and density levels can vary significantly; moreover, it has a very low proportion of doctors (2,000 physicians for a population of 24 million), and it has effectively used partnership with a mobile telecommunications network to support greater peer networks (see Box 8).

### **Box 8: Mobile Doctors Network in Ghana**

The Mobile Doctors Network (MDNet) provides free SIM cards to registered doctors, linked to phone numbers that offer free calls to colleagues within the MDNet programme. This allows for rapid access to peer advice and both enables practitioners to seek assistance in emergency situations and also facilitates referral processes. The costs of this service are borne by One Touch, the mobile arm of Ghana Telecom, and generate profits from personal calls made via the network to numbers outside the MDNet programme, building in financial sustainability. It is reported that the Ministry of Health is discussing the feasibility of extending the network across the Ministry.

*Source: WHO 2011: 37*

In addition, ICTs can be useful for supporting the gathering of information and enabling service providers to better understand and respond to the needs of users in more remote areas. This may be essential in order to be responsive to the needs of different populations, and thus contribute to greater trust and legitimacy.

Mobile phone technology can be used to collect data on service delivery, usage and needs and to feed this back to policy-makers. Useful examples include:

- The use of EpiSurveyor in Senegal: Funded by a partnership between the UN Foundation and the Vodafone Foundation, and implemented by the Ministry of Health and the World Health Organization (WHO), this trained CHWs to collect data using the EpiSurveyor software that can be used on standard mobile phones, smartphones and personal digital assistants (PDAs). The CHWs collected monthly information from health centres, which they sent to the district level for analysis following which it went to the Ministry of Health for synthesis across districts. Health officials used the data to reallocate budgets in order to respond to shortages or needs. It led to some key changes – for instance, the data identified the widespread lack of a Partogram, a basic and

---

inexpensive method used to assist in childbirth, and the Ministry of Health increased its distribution as a result. There are now plans to broaden the software use in other health-related areas.

- The use of EpiCollect in Kenya to improve the reporting of animal diseases outbreaks in livestock and to track vaccination campaigns: Working in partnership with the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), the Royal Veterinary College, Vetoid (a local NGO) and Google Kenya, EpiCollect provides phones to field veterinarians so that they can provide real-time information on the early stages of possible disease outbreaks, even in areas that were previously inaccessible. It also allows for data on the total number of livestock and number of vaccinated animals to be stored and for herd movements to be tracked and updated.<sup>5</sup>

The use of ICTs can therefore accelerate data-collection and processing and enable the identification of critical constraints. At the same time, ICTs can make service providers more visible and, where information from local communities is acted upon, show responsiveness and follow-up, supporting better perceptions of delivery. This approach has been applied in other sectors too. In Uganda, for instance, the Grameen Foundation Community Knowledge Worker programme recruited and trained rural Community Knowledge Workers to act as intermediaries for rural populations, using mobile technology to exchange agricultural information among smallholder farmers (Van Campenhout 2012).<sup>6</sup> In Mauritania, through a Rapid SMS (Short Message Service) project, mobile phones were used in conducting a nutrition survey and awareness-raising across the country. Such approaches could also work in other sectors.

---

<sup>5</sup> <http://www.fao.org/news/story/en/item/170807/icode/>

<sup>6</sup> <http://www.ckw.applab.org/section/index>



## Summary II: Relevance for the Sahel region and Northern Mali

ICTs offer opportunities to improve connectivity in low-density settings. The growing range of options can build greater connections among users, providers and policy-makers both as part of service delivery and to identify gaps in provision.

Such use seems to be most effective when ICTs are linked to clear areas of demand, such as in farming and the provision of accurate, real-time price information or for mobile banking. There are also useful innovations which use ICTs to improve communication and coordination, for instance in relation to maternal health. ICTs can also be used to gather information on users' preferences and needs, facilitating greater awareness and responsiveness on the part of providers.

The use of ICTs requires a good level of coverage and key infrastructure. While the rates of mobile phone coverage have expanded rapidly in North and sub-Saharan Africa in the past decade, they tend to be lowest in areas of low population density and in remote, isolated locations. Indeed, the landlocked countries of West and Central Africa (including Burkina Faso, Mali and Niger) have some of the lowest coverage rates on the continent (Aker and Mbiti 2010). Scaling up the use of ICTs as part of service delivery in the Sahel would require investment both in infrastructure (including base stations, electricity and Internet access) as well as in hardware (such as computers and mobile phones). The use of ICTs can be facilitated by effective government regulation (for instance to ensure competitive pricing models to stimulate demand) and by partnerships between government and the private sector and/or non-state actors such as technology providers (like Google) or service providers such as mobile phone operators. Another constraint may be in charging up mobile phones in nomadic or isolated settings. This could be addressed through solar or other technology.

In addition, using ICTs to deliver services and build greater connectivity in areas such as health and education depends on the provision of mobile phones, which can be prone to leakage or misuse, and requires effective monitoring and responsiveness on the part of service providers – including recourse if providers fail to act on information.

## 3.3 Hybrid arrangements for service delivery

Innovations for service delivery in low-density and diverse areas often take the form of hybrid arrangements. These recognise that in all countries, and particularly in sub-Saharan Africa, the governance of service delivery involves a range of public and private, formal and informal arrangements. The term 'practical hybrids' reflects government efforts to adapt to local preferences and accepted ways of doing things (Booth 2012). In other words, practical hybrids can reflect 'successful institutions [that] draw on the popular concepts of what is right and proper that are contained in local cultural "repertoires"' (Booth 2012). These can be particularly effective for engaging more remote communities and in areas where there are high levels of diversity (e.g. of indigenous populations, religion or ethnicity).

Customary institutions are often central to hybrid arrangements because they reflect the cultural and social norms that govern peoples' everyday lives. Customary institutions may be seen as more culturally sensitive or, where the state has a weak presence, they may be the most visible institutions at local levels (Marc et al. 2013). There may, however, be trade-offs in working with both formal and informal institutions (Marc et al. 2013).

A particularly relevant example is in the various ways in which Islamic schooling has been integrated into more formal systems of education in the Sahel region. In the mainly Francophone countries of the Sahel, the French system of secular education has historically been seen as out of touch with mainly Islamic populations. In response to the expectations of parents who want religious values to be an integral part of their children's education, this has encouraged the development of parallel systems of informal schools. In Mali, the Qur'anic (or madrassa) schools have flourished and in Niger Franco-Islamic schools have become

---

more popular than the Franco-Arab schools (Villalón et al. 2012a, 2012b; Villalón and Tidjani-Alou 2012).

While national policies to increase the number of children completing formal education have had limited success, these informal systems of education have continued to grow, but have not typically offered pupils the same access to employment opportunities as the official education system – and which is also high on the list of parents’ expectations. Research examining recent reform processes in these countries indicates that there has been a conscious attempt to bring educational institutions more into line with local realities, partly in recognition of some of these gaps (see Box 10). However, there is a need to play close attention to issues of education quality and equity, something not well addressed in recent research.

### **Box 10: Franco-Arab, Islamic and madrassa schools in Niger and Mali**

In Niger, state reforms have focused on borrowing elements, such as religious instruction, from the Franco-Islamic schools in order to expand the Franco-Arab system of schooling, while in Mali, past reforms attempted to create incentives for ‘madrassa’ schools to adopt the official state curriculum without relinquishing their religious missions.

What is interesting in these two cases is that parents’ refusal to send their children to state schools did not reflect a rejection of the state, but responded to a demand that the state system better reflect the prevailing moral and cultural values of the mainly Islamic population.

In both Mali and Niger, parents have welcomed hybrid reform approaches and there are early indications that school enrolment rates have increased, particular among girls. In some hybrid schools, girls have outnumbered boys, sometimes significantly, although the study did not address questions of education quality and gender-differentiated teaching curricula.

*Source: Villalón and Tidjani-Alou 2012*

In the area of justice and dispute-resolution, there have also been innovations that built on the notion of practical hybrids. There has been significant attention paid to the potential for non-state arrangements for justice provision as a way to improve access and trust, including the use of customary (chiefs’) courts and informal arrangements of dispute-resolution.

Research in Ghana highlights the importance of hybrid arrangements between state and non-state, and formal and informal provision, drawing on a large-scale multi-method comparative study of three types of justice provision (Crook 2011; Crook et al. 2010). It found that, while alternative dispute-resolution methods are available, they are mediated by the Magistrate’s court and, in particular, the courts provided by the Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice, a constitutional body established in 1992. Magistrates have been able to conduct procedures informally, using local languages and drawing on a variety of legal codes including customary law and cultural principles, such as respect for the elderly. Citizens report that such dispute-settlement has been fair (Booth 2012). In some justice systems, NGOs or civil-society networks have played mediating roles. For instance, in the Central African Republic, the Association des Femmes Juristes has sought to ensure that poor women receive a fair trial, creating space for women to voice their concerns and then helping them to navigate different systems of conflict-resolution and between local, informal justice systems and formal systems (Marc et al. 2013).

For nomadic populations, some countries have made specific efforts to adapt the delivery of services such as education to the beliefs and values of these communities. Such initiatives have included teaching in local languages, the involvement of customary authorities in service

---

provision, and the use of appropriate learning tools for mobile populations (such as radio), as part of a process of adapting to nomadic values and providing skills that are relevant to a nomadic lifestyle (Krätli 2001). This was the case in the education system in Mongolia, where teachers (most of whom came from nomadic communities) were allowed to adapt their methods of teaching and to make the content more relevant to pastoralist communities. At the organisational level, the school year was timetabled around the pastoral lifecycle in ways acceptable to parents. This helped to provide an informal cultural interface at both the delivery and organisational level (Krätli 2001).

In populations with high levels of diversity, these hybrid arrangements can often involve customary, traditional or religious authorities and other local community leaders in decision-making processes on how services are delivered – often as part of ‘co-production’ approaches. This recognises that different communities may have their own cultural values and traditions, giving rise to distinct service-delivery needs and aspirations; and to the recognition that such services need to respect and be appropriate to the local communities they are intended to serve in order to ensure uptake and build greater trust between users and providers. This has been apparent in education for indigenous communities (see Box 11).

### Box 11: Aboriginal Head Start on Reserve in Canada

The Aboriginal Head Start on Reserve programme in Canada sought to address disparities in educational attainment between first-nation, metis and Inuit children and non-aboriginal children. A key feature was a culture and language component that involved and valued customary authorities. Traditional teachers (such as drummers and story-tellers) and elders were called to share their knowledge and teachings with children through songs, stories and games in their own language, as part of efforts to improve children's readiness for school. Evaluations showed that children's practice of aboriginal culture, tradition and language had increased uptake and that parents viewed this positively.

Source: Ball 2008

The practice of community policing has also been increasingly used to enable communities and formal law-enforcement institutions to cooperate in contested settings and to reduce the perception of police officers as outsiders (this is discussed in more detail in the following section). Several programmes have explicitly sought to incorporate hybrid arrangements as part of these community-policing efforts. Examples include:

- In Canada, the Royal Canada Mounted Police (RCMP) adopted a collaborative community-based policy approach to address high levels of crime in the small and remote aboriginal community of Elsipogtog (Clairmont 2013). Adhering to the community's preference for addressing the underlying causes of crime, the formal police structure collaborated with police advisory committees, local crime-prevention workers and school education programmes. This resulted in the employment of more aboriginal officers and a staff sergeant with experience in policing aboriginal communities. Although the crime statistics are as yet inconclusive, there was reportedly an improved relationship with youths and significantly greater trust (Clairmont 2013).
- In Afghanistan, a key feature of the community-policing programme, *Police e mardumi*, was that it retained the essence of the traditional social structures through which it is implemented (Mukerjee and Rahim 2013). The pilot project achieved considerable success in enhancing information flows between the police and the population and this was in large part due to the involvement of traditional leaders (*shuras*, *maliks*, *wakils*) and local governance institutions (district governor, member of the district development assembly and of the

---

community development committee) with whom the acceptability of various components was discussed regularly. This ensured that programme activities, such as the creation of local information desks and police training, were in keeping with religious traditions and were demand-based (which was important in gaining trust of local people and community leaders). For example, the public requested monthly meetings with the police.

The above examples all highlight elements of more positive experiences in using ‘practical hybrids’, but there can also be negative effects and trade-offs to consider. In Aceh, for instance, customary institutions (*adat*) were formalised into state structures. As a result, communities saw an increase in the transfer of resources to and expansion of jurisdiction of these customary institutions, but also trade-offs in terms of the loss of decision-making discretion when customary laws were codified into the formal system (Marc et al. 2013). Similarly, in Yemen, tribal leaders were incorporated into state structures through the ‘sheikh system’. In practice, this undermined their standing in the longer term because they were seen as having been co-opted by political interests. The result was that they lost some legitimacy as tribal representatives, while also allowing the state to push through its agenda without making important state-building efforts in rural areas (Marc et al. 2013). This underlines the importance of assessing the potential for trade-offs and negative effects in practical hybrids.

Such hybrid arrangements often involve contributions from a range of state and non-state actors. This suggests there may be a particular role for supporting greater interactions at the local level between providers and users by enabling for facilitating a range of local problem-solving approaches that support these hybrid and ‘co-production’ arrangements. This has been emphasised by World Bank research into social dynamics, which stresses the importance of realising convergence across groups, so that their interests gradually merge and they see more incentives to collaborate (Marc et al. 2013).

To date, hybrid arrangements have been particularly prevalent in water and sanitation, including in approaches aiming to foster community-led changes in sanitation practice, in which the community must necessarily be involved. This often focuses on empowering communities to identify gaps in provision and to identify what actions they and others can take to address these. Examples include:

- The Orangi Pilot Project run by the Research and Training Institute in Pakistan, where a local NGO facilitated community action in informal settlements and slums. These had historically been outside formal provision, resulting in open defaecation and waste disposal, and contributing to significant health and environmental risks. The NGO focused on dialogue with the Karachi authorities as well as, for instance, helping local communities to construct sewer channels to collect waste from their own homes and connecting these with the city’s truck sewers (Bano 2011; Sansom 2011).
- In Afghanistan, the Northern NGO Tearfund sought to facilitate community-level collaboration and involvement in sanitation provision, supporting them to work together to build latrines as part of Community-Led Total Sanitation efforts (Tearfund 2010). This programme was reported to have had sufficient impact to sustain an informal collective effort to achieve safe sanitation at the community level (Tearfund 2011).
- In Tanzania, SNV (the Dutch development agency) worked closely with the government to conduct water-point mapping and to support capacity-building and training for service providers (Tilley 2012). Its work initially focused on district-level and then national-level water-point mapping, in partnership with the government. This provided up-to-date information to assist policy formulation and budget allocation on the functionality of water points. This was then developed into an accountability component that used coaching and training to help local councillors, district water teams and Community Owned

---

Water Supply Organisations to hold both the government and their community to account for water services.

In the health sector, too, there have also been examples of communities facilitating local solutions to particular problems. In Niger, local government authorities in Dosso, with the agreement of the regional health management committee, initiated an ‘extra pennies’ scheme to fund fuel and staffing for ambulances in rural and hard-to-reach areas (Olivier de Sardan 2012a, 2012b). A small fee (‘one penny’) was collected at all health centres and district/regional hospitals and pooled at the departmental level, managed by a committee (which included the mayor, the head of the health unit, members of the health management committee and an external auditor). This scheme was found to be an effective local response to plugging a core gap in provision. It was then introduced in other regions. Research suggests it provided practical response to a pressing issue and helped to improve provision as well as community interface with providers. The initiative was subsequently suspended when the Minister of Health felt it did not accord with the national policy to provide free health care to pregnant women and children, highlighting the importance of ensuring that policies are consistent and coherent and that there is also space for effective local initiatives.

Other informal financing arrangements include experience with Home Town Associations in Mali, which in the past have complemented public investment. As discussed above, participants in the Home Town Association were found to have better local services than localities that did not (Chauvet et al. 2013). This in part reflected a pre-1998 period before the decentralisation process established municipal councils, but nevertheless provides an interesting example of an existing institutional arrangement that could be built upon.

### **Summary III: Relevance for the Sahel region and Northern Mali**

The need to adapt the way in which services are provided and by whom to suit local preferences and accepted ways of doing things is likely to be particularly relevant to the Sahel region, and for working in areas with diverse populations. For example, populations in Northern Mali may perceive the state as a distant and external power with limited legitimacy, and whose institutions are alien to traditional forms of local governance and values.

It is crucial that hybrid approaches build on existing institutional logics. Customary authorities may be one element of this, but there will be other important features on which to build. For instance, the ‘extra pennies’ scheme in Niger built on existing logics of cost-recovery and histories of informal user fees; in Elsipogtog in Canada, community policing built on histories of local problem-solving, and programmes in Australia relied on the existence of networks of Community Resource Centres capable of introducing key programmes. It is therefore critical to identify hybrid arrangements from which delivery processes can operate. Efforts to develop hybrid educational arrangements, such as incorporating Islamic beliefs and practices, are instructive. Other options might include basing tax collection on more culturally accepted forms such as zakat or informal user fees (République du Mali, 2012).

Moreover, while it can be important to find ways to involve and build on customary authorities, it will be necessary to separate the roles of formal and informal entities – for instance, the clear delineation of roles and responsibilities regarding dispute-resolution has been found to be key. Indeed, customary practices can at times work in tension with formal processes, further reinforcing the need for policy coherence and a clear separation of mandates. The trade-offs and potentially negative effects also need to be closely assessed.

## **3.4 Delivering services in the context of sub-national conflict**

The above discussion has focused on dynamics for service delivery in low-density areas, including where there are nomadic or indigenous populations, or forms of ethnic, religious

---

and other diversity. There are some common features of more innovative approaches identified, principally in terms of increased mobility and adaptability, connectivity and the use of hybrid arrangements. Many of these features can be applied in contexts that are also affected by conflict. This section focuses on some particular features of efforts to address sub-national and localised conflicts. It looks at experience in a range of reconciliation and reconstruction approaches, as well as briefly examining experience in community policing and in efforts to reduce conflict over access to natural resources.

First, there is a range of models to support community-level post-conflict reconciliation and reconstruction. These approaches often favour community-based mechanisms (for instance, forms of social accountability, social funds, and community-driven reconstruction/development) to channel development assistance. The underlying assumption is that it is essential to involve communities in the design, planning, management and control of development projects in settings where there is thought to be a lack of trust and where communities themselves may be divided.

Recent reviews point to some key conditions for community-based reconstruction approaches of this kind to be effective. They suggest that such approaches work best in the presence of a strong and responsive state and where there are connections between supply and demand (Vervisch et al. 2013; Mansuri and Rao 2012). Of particular importance in the framework of this study is that it can be more challenging to induce participatory approaches in remote and isolated environments (Mansuri and Rao 2012: 13).

Moreover, community-driven development programmes have been criticised for making simplistic assumptions, for example that communities are homogenous and reach decisions equitably; that new decision-making institutions need to be set up; or that the main benefits (and focus) of these programmes is to deliver cost-effective basic services (Marc et al. 2013). These assumptions can seriously undermine programmes, as may be reflected in disagreements with local governments (over the creation of new institutions), ignorance of customary institutions and existing dispute-resolution mechanisms, and failing to beyond a narrow focus on delivering basic services (Marc et al. 2013).

Such risks make it essential to draw lessons from programmes that have been effective, such as in Afghanistan, Indonesia and elsewhere. One prominent example is the National Solidarity Programme, a key development programme of the Government of Afghanistan (see Box 13).

### **Box 13: National Solidarity Programme in Afghanistan**

The National Solidarity Programme had two main pillars – first, it created new local governance structures through the creation of Community Development Councils, established in 361 districts in Afghanistan's 34 provinces, and second, it supported the implementation of development projects designed and selected by the village community, through block grants (valued at US\$200 per household).

The Programme was implemented by 28 NGOs, known as Facilitating Partners, under the direction of the government, and was funded by the World Bank (a US\$358 million grant) and 31 donor nations through the World Bank-administered Afghanistan Reconstruction Trust Fund (ARTF), totalling US\$618 million, or through bilateral contributions.

An independent evaluation indicated that the NSP had a positive impact on the lives of villagers – both improving access to critical services and creating opportunities for women to participate in local governance. Importantly, it found that the NSP had an effect on perceptions of government and non-government officials, resulting in a higher proportion of villagers who believed that local and national government officials were working in the interests of all villagers. The programme did not seem, however, to affect the level of village-level trust or the incidence of disputes, feuds or attacks. Significantly, the positive impact on perceptions of government were largely confined



---

to the implementation period, and it was found that villagers generally reverted to their earlier attitudes towards the government after the funds had been spent. This underlines the importance of sustainability and the 'embeddedness' of new institutions.

*Source: Beath et al. 2013*

Similar approaches have been tried in a number of other settings:

- In Indonesia, following sub-national conflict, a community-driven reconstruction programme, known SCRAPs, developed a three-pronged approach: to support local reconciliation processes; to support productive sectors and job creation; and to provide access to health and education services. Some evidence suggests that the establishment of participatory community processes to address collective needs (through community-based organisations, or CBOs) provided important local spaces for conflict- and dispute-mediation (Strand et al. 2003). This emphasises the importance of proper CBO formation as essential to achieving success.
- A community-reconstruction project implemented by the International Rescue Committee (IRC) in northern Liberia was found to have contributed to a reducing social tension and enhancing trust in local leadership, as well as in greater participation by marginalised groups (Fearon et al. 2008). The key features of this project, which set it apart from other projects of this type (including those implemented by IRC elsewhere), was that it was small-scale (in funding) with a short timeline and a small staff number relative to the communities served (Fearon et al.: 29). A Randomised Control Trial (RCT) evaluation suggested that the provision of funds to Community Development Committees (CDCs) may have increased faith and trust in village-level institutions by giving community leaders an opportunity to manage projects for the benefit of the village – but crucially because (as the data from the control areas shows) the communities were less divided than had been assumed (Fearon et al.:30).

Drawing from the examples above, and other recent reviews, some key features appear to contribute to the effectiveness of these types of community-driven development (CDD) or community-reconstruction programmes. This includes whether the programme is based on a broad vision of local governance – for instance, whether it helps to establish a framework within which local institutions can develop and build bridges across formal and informal institutions in ways that are inclusive and respond to real needs (Marc et al. 2013). This must be built on a strong understanding of context in order to identify the communities' most pressing needs (which may not be the delivery of basic services); make explicit links to state institutions and enable relationship-building over time; and incorporate mediation- and conflict-resolution mechanisms (building on what already exists where possible) (Marc et al., 2013). Experience also suggests the need for a broad view of services, to include both infrastructure costs and service operations (so communities are involved in running services), livelihood activities, security and so on (Marc et al. 2013). The existence of arenas in which diverse and divergent socio-economic groups can constructively engage in problem-solving may be particularly relevant where there is a history of inter- or intra-group conflict (e.g. over access to land and resources) or where specific groups or regions are perceived to have been consistently marginalised. Governance mechanisms that permit diverse communities to 'co-habit' may therefore be key to preserving peace and avoiding conflict, important prerequisites for ensuring trust and the provision of basic services.

---

With this in mind, an example from the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC), where there is a very high capacity for destructive ethnic conflict, is important. Although outside the direct sphere of the provision of services, it points to ways in which constructive engagement at sub-provincial and local levels can potentially limit damaging conflict among different ethnic groups.

At the provincial level in DRC, *de facto* power-sharing arrangements involving informal mediation or negotiations take place outside formal processes and involve determining in advance the candidates who will be put forward for provincial government posts (such as governorships, presidency of the provincial assembly, deputy positions and provincial ministerial posts) in order to ensure an appropriate balance of ethnic and social interests and avoid clashes. For example, in Kasai Occidental, there was a consensus on which of the two main ethnic groups (Lulua and Kasaian) would hold the governorship and the presidency of the Assembly, through an ‘unspoken rule’ on the need to avoid the over-representation of the majority ethnic community. Internally, political parties, which had members from both ethnic groups, were obliged to abide by these informal agreements designed to maintain equilibrium. Likewise in Katanga (DRC’s mining region) the Katangaise foundation (a body made up of representatives from each of the province’s 43 ethnic groups) played an important role in negotiating how the ten provincial ministerial positions would be allocated to ensure that they reflect the perceived appropriate weight of the ethnic groups (author’s field notes 2013).

This example suggests that there may already be arrangements that can work to solve particular problems or tensions, the implications of which must be borne in mind in supporting formal systems. In particular, it underlines the critical importance of an in-depth knowledge of the governance arena as it functions in any particular context in order to ensure that formal reform processes do not disrupt existing and functioning, informal arrangements.

These sorts of hybrid and informal arrangements can also be seen in relation to recent expansions in community policing, and can be particularly relevant for conflict-affected areas, where control over security provision has been contested. Community-policing models have been put forward as useful in existing institutional arrangements and community relations, and as offering the potential to defuse local conflict and tensions (Denney and Jenkins 2013). These differ from the examples of community-reconstruction efforts described above, in that community policing is often self-financed (i.e. by communities) (Denney and Jenkins 2013). There is a range of useful international experiences on which to draw:

- In Australia, night patrols emerged as an indigenous initiative to operate a safe transport and outreach service for people on the streets at night (Barclay and Scott 2013). They were first started by women in Yuendumu in the 1990s to challenge violence in the absence of effective intervention by the mainstream justice systems. Night patrols performed a number of functions, including assisting community members who may be at risk of becoming a victim or of causing harm, by providing transport to safe places, moving youth off the streets, and acting as a nexus between the police, courts, clinics and families. With support from (but not necessarily the engagement of) local police, the community relies on resources of indigenous people and their codes of conduct.
- In Canada, Kentville police services have encouraged a movement towards community-based policing (Thomas and Clairmont 2013). This built on the spontaneous development of initiatives in small and remote communities, including the resumption of foot patrols, mandates for responding to citizens’ complaints and proactive problem-solving through small-town policing. This approach is thought to have enhanced perception of public safety and improved the popularity of the local police force.
- In Niger, a community-policing system has enabled the police to better understand its role among dispersed populations and has increased trust between the police and the population (Ilkjaer 2013). The police recruit and



---

train volunteers to undertake patrols, and hold regular meetings with religious groups and mayors (who finance the volunteers); supervise and organise the community-policing patrols; and promote community dialogue. The system has connections with the criminal justice system as police can use conflict-resolution mechanisms for certain crimes and do so in front of traditional leaders.

- In Madagascar, community police officers play an essential role in providing a first-line defence against poaching and illegal trade, protecting the country's unique biodiversity, particularly during political turmoil when the government had reduced capacity in isolated rural regions (Ratsimbazafy 2013). Although part of the formal policing structure, customary authorities were heavily involved in selecting the community police, who remained hierarchically accountable to the *Fokonolona* administrative chief, general assembly and its notables (or elders). This gave the community police officers local legitimacy and also meant that the community could sanction them. Furthermore, the extensive integration of the community police officers within the formal policing structures, from the community to national level, and across divisions of the policing sector (e.g. justice, forestry commission) was a key element in building effective linkages between the formal service and more traditional/customary approaches.

Specific implications for conflict sensitivity arise in relation to nomadic populations in relation to natural resource management and conflict-mediation. This is especially relevant for the Sahel region, which is witnessing increasing competition for access to land, water and other natural resources, contributing at times to violent and frequent conflict over resources essential to maintaining livelihoods. At the same time, a growing population means that local farmers are encroaching on land previously reserved for grazing while the government's allocation of land for private use has further reduced grazing areas for pastoral communities. This dynamic has threatened food security and livelihoods, bringing nomadic populations increasingly into closer proximity with pastoralists.

A number of local-level conflict-mediation approaches have been developed to guarantee access to water points for nomadic pastoralists and to protect the crops of the sedentary farmers. Among the various examples of where this has been undertaken (including Chad, Ethiopia and Sudan) a key feature has been the involvement of customary authorities and drawing upon traditional methods of mediation:

- In Chad, the *Agence Française de Développement* (AFD) financed a programme for the Chadian authorities that created water points and defined the parameters of migratory corridors used by nomadic herders and their livestock. This approach aimed to improve the participation and responsibility of communities and private-sector operators by facilitating customary authorities to use traditional forms of conflict mediation ('*abre de palabre*') to negotiate the boundaries for nomadic corridors. This contributed both to improvements in herders' productivity and revenues and to better relations between nomadic and sedentary populations, and thus greater stability in the region.
- In Sudan, an initiative to support greater dialogue over the use of community forests, including pastoralists and settled farmers, focused on conflict-resolution (Egeimi et al. 2003). Traditional leaders were involved throughout, which meant that processes for conflict-resolution and negotiation were devised in culturally appropriate ways.
- Other initiatives that have sought to address potential conflict include an approach in Niger, where, during the seasonal migration of nomadic pastoralists from the mountains to the lowlands, the local population in Balleyara contributes to a fund to pay for petrol and per diems for the

---

*gendarmes* or *forces nationales d'intervention et de sécurité* to undertake security patrols (Abdoulkader 2013). These patrols help to ensure that the pastoralists travel along the demarcated corridors. Contributions are collected by village chiefs and handed to the *Chef de canton* (or head of the municipality).

- In Ethiopia, community training on pastoralism has been provided, and legislation has been translated into local languages and disseminated via radio, as a means to reduce inter-group conflicts and enhance the local-level resolution of land conflicts. Working with traditional institutions was thought to help increase its legitimacy in the eyes of communities (IIED 2002).
- Other examples in the Sahel region include the involvement of customary leaders and traditional methods of mediation in resolving conflicts over access water points, particularly between nomadic and sedentary pastoral communities in countries such as Chad, Ethiopia and Sudan (AFD, IIED 2002; Farm Africa 2001; Egemi et al. 2003).

Some of the initiatives discussed above may be supported or facilitated by non-state providers. Indeed, one feature of many post-conflict environments may be a high level of such providers, which is also often true in many low-density and remote areas. In these contexts, it may be particularly important to build in government oversight roles. There are some useful examples for how to 'contract out' services while maintaining a role for government in fragile and post-conflict contexts. These include:

- In Afghanistan, health services were 'contracted out' to a range of NGOs, allowing for rapid delivery while the government gained and maintained policy leadership. The government set priorities, allocated geographic responsibility, and provided financial and performance monitoring, enabling the Ministry of Public Health to provide direction to a previously uncoordinated system. It also allowed NGOs some level of autonomy while still working in line with national priorities (Ghani and Bizhan 2009).
- In Liberia, the Ministry of Health and Social Welfare initiated a large health reform programme following the end of conflict, which included a new public-private partnership (PPP) model for health-service delivery. This was led by the government, based on a performance-based contracting approach, and was seen as ensuring a relatively smooth transition from humanitarian relief to development financing (Abramson 2009).

Finally, regional conflict dynamics are also important. The Sahel region is one of the poorest regions in the world. The prevalence of weak state institutions and an absence of alternative economic opportunities have contributed to the rise of organised crime, in particular the smuggling and trafficking of goods, including drugs. This has been accompanied by an increase in terrorist activity (amid the proliferation of Islamic fundamentalist groups), the consequences of the end of the Gaddafi regime in Libya and a long-running Tuareg rebellion (an underlying factor in the continuing conflict in Northern Mali and Niger).

This raises a number of important issues. First, an important aspect is how to address border issues and cross-border movements. National and regional concerns typically result in policy approaches that aim to secure and patrol borders, but their magnitude and remoteness in an area like the Sahel region makes their effective policing an almost impossible task. It also needs to be recognised that in such areas, where borders have long been contested, such policy responses might run counter to greater trust in the state.

Furthermore, empirical studies on cross-border areas in the Sahel indicate that cooperation and integration in these areas may be constrained rather than facilitated by formal macro-regional and national processes. While borders and cross-border cooperation remain under the control of national governments, in reality boundaries and borders have little perceived

legitimacy and are largely ignored both by the nomadic populations and traders who regularly traverse them. However, there are many what Soderbaum and Taylor (2007, 2008) call ‘micro-regions’ – which lie between the national and local level – and in which informal practices enable cooperation. In a study of cross-border cooperation between Niger and Nigeria in the Maradi micro-region such *de facto* cooperation and dialogue was found to have contributed to improved cross-border relations, in part by their capacity to build on shared historical ethnic and kinship ties (Trémolières and Abdoul 2007). In a micro-region on the border between Mali and Burkina Faso, formal regional cooperation was found to have impeded cross-border flows, leading to significant pressure ‘from below’ to legitimise cross-border trade and linkages (Trémolières 2007). Identifying the potential for greater micro-regional solutions may therefore be of critical importance.

Second, at a local level empirical research reinforced the need to promote a viable rural economy to provide sustainable livelihoods for the regional population in order to counteract incentives to engage in cross-border smuggling and informal trade. Lessons from Afghanistan may also be useful here. For example, in Helmand Province, new training colleges were established (supported by the UK-led Provincial Reconstruction Team) for Afghan farmers, to provide skills and resources to grow legal crops, providing them with an alternative income to opium poppies. Farmers were encouraged to destroy poppy fields in favour of cultivating wheat and other crops from subsidised seeds (USIP undated). While some provinces have moved towards being ‘opium free’, however, commentators view Afghanistan’s economy as still reliant on drugs, highlighting how deeply entrenched these networks can be (Gavrilis 2010).

Any of the strategies discussed above must be predicated on local, regional and national dialogue in which diverse populations feel represented and included. This should help to determine what types of strategy – and service-delivery priorities – are identified and adopted. Other countries emerging from forms of internal conflict have sought to instigate national-level consultation and dialogue processes, as part of defining what more inclusive states might look like. Examples include:

- In Kenya, a new Constitution process followed a period of electoral violence in 2007. This articulated a new vision of social equity and sought to make a break with the past. It set out a new institutional framework of oversight, participation and decision-making, and enshrined new rights, particularly to health and education, in efforts to address past grievances underlying the conflict (Domingo and Wild 2011).
- In Colombia, a Constitution process in the 1990s sought to use a more open and participatory process with engagement from different social sectors. It also established new definitions of citizenship and accountability and oversight processes (Rocha Menocal 2007).

Where there are influential regional networks and actors, it can be important to involve them, as illustrated in the peace processes in Cambodia and Afghanistan (Ghani and Lockhart 2006).

## Summary VI: Relevance for the Sahel region and Northern Mali

Community-reconstruction approaches have been effective in a number of settings, and seem to work best when linked to funding of specific development projects and processes of community-level involvement and reconciliation. In some settings, it may be possible to build on existing institutional arrangements and processes. In others, it will be necessary to support new institutions, and here, issues of sustainability and the ‘embeddness’ of any new institutions will be key.

---

Some major enabling factors also need to be in place, including the capacity for community mobilisation and collective action, and the responsiveness and capacity on the part of providers. How these programmes are implemented can also be very significant for their effectiveness. It is vital to combine strong understanding of context with a focus on supporting local institutions and mediation mechanisms. Identifying where these exist – and where they are lacking – is likely to be key in considerations about whether and how to implement similar strategies in the Sahel.

Community policing has emerged as a post-conflict strategy, particularly for addressing issues of trust between police or armed forces and communities. These are often self-financed and tend to build upon existing institutional arrangements, but can help to improve trust between citizens and police in some settings.

It can be important to identify specific conflict risks, for instance in terms of access to natural resources or the existence of regional terrorist or criminal networks, and to develop interventions to address these. Again, this is likely to involve mediation and facilitation, building on existing institutional arrangements, and connecting to some of the underlying causes, such as livelihoods or economic opportunities, as well as their symptoms. Another important element is the role of regional processes – and the potential of some regional and sub-regional mechanisms for dialogue, dispute-resolution and collaboration.

Any such strategies need to be predicated on local and national dialogue in which diverse populations feel represented and included. This should help to determine what types of strategy – and service-delivery priorities – are identified and pursued.

---

# 4 Building an enabling environment

This section explores the broader enabling environment as an accompaniment to the specific examples of innovation identified above. It reviews experience of a range of governance models and their impact on service delivery, with a specific focus on decentralisation, and on models that favour a strong role for community engagement and participation.

## 4.1 Governance models for service delivery

This sub-section explores experience with a range of governance models, including forms of decentralisation and federalism, with a focus on low-density populations. It also sets out some implications in terms of resources and planning processes.

In remote settings, post-conflict environments and in communities with high levels of socio-cultural diversity, where it is considered that there has been a lack of between the state and citizens, democratic decentralisation reforms have often been hailed as a means to bring government ‘closer to communities’. The decentralisation of resources and decision-making powers to local authorities has been commonly promoted as a means to, among other things, improve the delivery of public goods and services, increase the accountability and responsiveness of the state to the needs of the population, and reduce central government expenditure.

A growing body of empirical research and international experience indicates, however, that the impact of democratic decentralisation remains inconclusive in these settings, for example with respect to reducing poverty, participatory decision-making processes, quality of services, administrative performance, and local resource availability (Crook 2003; Conyer 2007; Robinson 2007; Booth 2012; Mansuri and Rao 2012; Wunsch 2013). With respect to service delivery, there remains a lack of evidence to suggest that democratic decentralisation is a preferable governance model to the ‘de-concentration’ of state services (administrative and technical), for instance. There is also evidence that improvements in service delivery have in some cases been achieved *without* the sorts of major change of orientation at the national level required by decentralisation policies, through centralised governance and ‘de-concentrated’ governance models (Booth 2013).

Unsurprisingly, the evidence suggests that it is the extent and form of decentralisation, and the nature of its implementation, as well as the nature of the broader governance environment, that are key determinants of the impacts on service delivery. When decentralisation has contributed to improved local public services, it has typically done so in combination with other key factors, notably the existence of a strong central state (Crook 2003), and where there is a coherent national and local policy environment (Mansuri and Rao 2012). Furthermore, the diversity of decentralisation approaches and traditions (particularly between

---

the Anglophone and Francophone countries) is important and may have specific implications for local governance structures and the delivery of local goods and services, particularly in the African context.

Historical colonial legacies mean that the political and institutional systems in Francophone countries borrow heavily from French governance traditions and this has wide implications for a broad range of institutions, including territorial administration and decentralisation processes. The French administrative system, for example, has historically been characterised by a greater level of centralisation, and decentralisation has been a comparatively recent phenomenon in Francophone countries (late 1980s and 1990s). Perhaps as a result, studies on decentralisation processes in Africa note that Francophone countries have lower levels of decentralisation than do their Anglophone counterparts (Ndegwa 2002). Furthermore, decentralisation is not conceptualised in the same manner by the two traditions and this may give rise to different meanings (see Box 15).

### **Box 15: Anglophone and Francophone definitions of decentralisation**

Decentralisation can have different meanings in French and English (Ouedraogo 2003). In the Anglophone literature, decentralisation is often associated with the devolution of power and resources to local authorities through some combination of political, fiscal and administrative decentralisation. The French tradition tends to view decentralisation through a more legalistic lens in which autonomous local governments are endowed with specific competences within a more centralised system. Understood in this way, some have argued that decentralisation in the French tradition is more about reorganising the state than about a significant shift in power.

*Source: Ouedraogo 2003*

In the same vein there may be historically inherited differences towards service delivery in particular sectors, which may be worth reflecting on in Francophone countries. For example, France has always promoted its secular system of education in its former colonies and this has had particular implications in the Sahelian countries, which are predominantly Islamic.

In rural areas of Francophone African countries, ‘decentralisation’ efforts have often taken the form of communal modes of local governance, including the creation of elected municipal councils, often with a mayor chosen from among the councillors, which administer territorial districts with budgetary autonomy (Olivier de Sardan 2009). In Niger, the election of mayors has often been strongly contested, and even once elected, mayors have faced permanent internal contestation, sometimes leading to efforts to depose them. While municipal councils are organised into committees in Niger, these are often not operational, in part because of a cited lack of resources to enable them to operate. Moreover, by opening up the local political arena, decentralisation in Niger has created new opportunities for *ressortissants* – those originally from the region who have moved, either to major towns, the capital or abroad (Olivier de Sardan 2009). These may participate in local elections or through clients, relatives or dependants who still live in the locality. This reinforces the need to understand the key features that characterise public governance, as national-level patterns will often be repeated at local levels, and there may be divergence between formal and informal processes.

Moreover, even in countries with the same political structure there is no single model of decentralisation or ‘de-concentration’ and it is not uncommon to see both forms of governance applied at the same time. In countries in which the cultural and historical experience of regions diverge, and the local economy, political dynamics and natural resources are diverse, it may be appropriate to apply different models of decentralisation and/or ‘de-concentration’. This may include forms of ‘asymmetric decentralisation’ to

different regions or areas, such as large cities or urban municipalities with greater capacity being assigned more functions than those in more rural and remote areas whose capacity is weaker.

Asymmetric decentralisation can also be used as both an economic and a cultural strategy, for instance to balance fiscal structure or to give value to diversity. Countries such as China, France, Indonesia and Japan are examples of asymmetric decentralisation. For example, France gives greater power to Corsica (Utomo 2009) (see Box 16). Similar governance arrangements might be particularly important in the Malian context, given that the level of autonomy accorded to the northern regions has been a key driver of successive Touareg revolts.

### Box 16: Examples of asymmetric decentralisation

- In Indonesia, special autonomy laws were enacted for Aceh and Papua. For Aceh, these laws provide legal rights to implement aspects of Islamic law, allow for some separate identity (e.g. a flag), and for specific processes concerning local elections and revenue-sharing, as well as some new powers for provincial government and a large increase in its budget. In relation to Papua, laws have affirmed that indigenous peoples have their own cultures, histories and cultural laws (known as *Adat*).
- In China, special autonomous regions in Tibet and Xinjiang recognise histories of autonomy and particular ethnic or religious identities.

*Source: Utomo 2009*

Countries with federal governments have also used such asymmetric arrangements, often to increase support for and oversight of more marginalised areas. In Australia and Canada, for example, services to marginalised areas (i.e. with remote and indigenous populations) are delivered by federal government rather than by decentralised government entities, despite the fact that service delivery in general is decentralised in these countries.

In Australia, a 2005 government decision ensured that intervention in aboriginal affairs would henceforth come directly from the federal level in order to address poor social outcomes in aboriginal communities. Similarly in Canada, the regions most heavily populated by indigenous or ‘first nation’ communities, such as the North West Territory, are not full provinces but territories. Under this governance structure, Canada’s indigenous communities deal directly with the federal rather than the provincial government, in an inter-state manner. Indigenous communities (such as the Inuit) receive special subsidies and quotas in services such as education and the federal state has numerous obligations to provide universal service obligations to the marginalised communities.

Different types of decentralised or ‘de-concentrated’ provision will also have implications for financing, and a number of countries have developed principles for the allocation of finances for service delivery, including formulas for financial allocations to local authorities. This has been a core part of ‘fiscal equalisation’, or efforts to ensure that local authorities provide citizens with similar types of public services at a similar tax burden even if incomes (and revenues) vary across areas (Blöchliger and Charbit 2008); or where there are heterogeneous user preferences or circumstances (e.g. if some regions prefer or need different levels, quality or languages of delivery of particular services) (Yilmaz et al. 2012). The main objectives are to ensure equity, set against impacts on efficiency and fiscal stability (Blöchliger and Charbit 2008.).

This is critical because there can be marked differences in the costs of providing services to areas of concentrated and dispersed populations. Equalisation can operate horizontally –



---

transferring funds between local governments – and vertically, via transfers from central to local governments. Across many OECD countries, revenue equalisation tends to be horizontal while cost equalisation (i.e. cost of service delivery) tends to be vertical (Yilmaz et al. 2012). Cost equalisation can be based on the nature of local authorities' revenue sources, the nature of decentralised services, and geographic and socio-economic indicators. Geographic indicators can be used to reflect the differences in unit costs for providing a service (e.g. road maintenance is more expensive in mountainous areas) while socio-economic indicators can reflect differences in need (Yilmaz et al. 2012).

An OECD report finds that cost equalisation can be more prone to budget drift or inflation than revenue equalisation and that it can be complex and difficult to manage (Yilmaz et al. 2012). It can also be significantly affected by the wider governance context (see Box 17).

### Box 17: Equalisation transfers

Political factors can affect equalisation policies. An OECD report highlights examples, for instance from Mexico, where transfers made in the early 1990s favoured states loyal to the dominant political party; or in the USA, where party affiliation between federal and state politicians has been found to increase the level of transfers.

Some countries have found ways to address this, by establishing arm's-length agencies to oversee allocation processes, thus creating less space for political influence. This has been the case in Australia, for example.

*Source: Blöchliger and Charbit 2008*

A World Bank Policy Research Paper emphasises the importance of 'keeping it simple' in designing fiscal transfers, and focusing on one objective, noting that calculations for expenditure need or cost equalisation require complex and difficult analysis, which means that while it remains desirable, it may not always be practical (Shah 2006). Similarly, analysis of fiscal equalisation efforts in Indonesia highlighted challenges in terms of generating appropriate formulas given the constraints on sub-national data and the potential costs in terms of mis-targeting to presumed expenditure needs and fiscal capacity (Hofman et al. 2006). This has prompted some calls to address fiscal need equalisation through output-based sectoral grants (see Box 18). The importance of a national consensus, which takes account of views from all key stakeholders and reflects an appropriate political compact, has also been emphasised.

### Box 18: Output-based sectoral grants

According to Shah (2006), developing countries have rarely used output-based transfers to ensure minimum service standards, often opting instead for complex financing formulas. However, some examples are highlighted, such as:

- In Chile, per-pupil grants were provided to all schools and a 25% additional grant as a salary bonus for teachers in the best-performing schools. Finance vouchers for school grants are used to give parents greater choice in deciding to send their children to state or private schools. Moreover, grants to municipal governments were used to improve poor people's access to water and sewer services (covering between 25% and 85 % of household water and sewer bills, with the user paying the rest).
- In Brazil, federal per-pupil grants were provided to states for secondary education and to municipalities for primary education. Under the constitution, state and municipal governments must contribute 15% of their principal revenue sources (state value-added tax and service tax, state and



municipal share of federal revenue-sharing transfers) to the special fund for primary education. If the total contribution divided by the number of primary pupils is less than the national standard, the federal government makes up the difference.

*Source: Shah 2006*

Moreover, decisions on what to invest in may be critical. In the Colombian city of Medellín, where there had been traditionally low levels of trust between users and providers of services and the government, a new mayor prioritised the quick upgrading of marginalised districts, combined with stronger enforcement of the rule of law. This was seen to support perceptions of better service delivery and of procedural or administrative fairness, breaking the pattern of distrust (Guerrero 2011).

Finally, the timing and sequencing of decentralisation processes also matters. The internal political incentives for decentralising may have little to do with bringing services closer to the population and political support for devolution policies may alter as political tendencies shift. This is particularly relevant when decentralisation processes are developed as part of power-sharing transition periods – when there may be a greater political convergence, for example, around the desirability of retaining the concentration of power in particular regions/provinces or in limiting the central power of the state. Such incentives may no longer be present once transition has been completed – the DRC provides one example of where this has been the case – and this may help to explain why in the African context, there can be a significant gap between formal decentralisation reform processes and their implementation in practice. It is not unreasonable to question how far the momentum of the decentralisation process in Mali will remain dynamic following the election of Ibrahim Boubacar Keïta.

Moreover, decentralisation takes a long time to implement – from the decision-making process through to the creation of the necessary legislation and the implementation of reforms – and is not therefore a ‘quick win’. Sectoral programming based on the assumption that decentralisation has already happened or will be implemented effectively is therefore likely to be flawed.

## 4.2 Targeting remote or marginalised areas

There has been a range of experience in building poverty and equity indicators for resource allocations and transfers, for instance from the central to local government levels. These often provide only a relatively blunt measure of levels of need or marginalisation, and determining calculations of allocations can be highly politicised and disputed. Nonetheless, there has been some useful experience in efforts to better direct resources to where they are most needed.

One interesting example is the creation of Poverty Maps in Kenya. These were first published in 2003 resulting from an innovative two-year research project by the Central Bureau of Statistics, a department in Kenya’s Ministry of Planning and National Development, in collaboration with the International Livestock Research Institute (ILRI) and with technical and financial assistance from the World Bank, the Rockefeller Foundation and the World Resources Institute. Mapping and statistical modelling were used to identify where the poorest Kenyans were located, using data from household expenditure surveys and census information. They were used to assist in determining resource allocations and informing local-level decision-making, in order to deploy public resources and service delivery more effectively. They contributed to the development of a new Poverty Analysis Unit in the

---

Central Bureau of Statistics, and enabled improved policy making across a range of sectors due to the generation of new poverty data (ILRI News 22/06/2011).

Other specific measures can be used to address particular groups or areas of need. These include the use of cash transfers or vouchers, which have been effectively deployed in a range of low-density settings. Cash transfers can be particularly visible and tangible as transfers from government to the poor and, some have argued, can help to (re-)build state–citizen relations and state legitimacy (Holmes 2009).

Recent experience includes northern Uganda, where there has been long experience in using cash transfers in education, which were found to meet a diverse range of needs. Similarly in North Kivu in the DRC, the Emergency Assistance Programme included school-fee vouchers, which proved highly popular, resulting in 20% of beneficiaries opting to pay for school fees (Holmes 2009). There is also some evidence that cash transfers can improve state–society relations; in northern Kenya, for instance, the Social Protection Rights component of a Hunger Safety Nets Programme was found to improve perceptions of the state (Osofisan 2011).

In West Africa, there are also some cash-transfer programmes, the lessons from which could be usefully built upon. These include (see ODI/UNICEF 2009):

- In Nigeria, a small conditional cash-transfer (CCT) programme called In Care of the Poor was launched by the National Poverty Eradication Programme, to provide transfers to very poor and vulnerable households, on the condition that adult members attended training sessions, kept their children in school and used health services.
- In Sierra Leone, a government pilot, the Social Safety Net, was aimed at elderly people with no other means of support.
- In Ghana, a government pilot, Livelihood Empowerment Against Poverty, aimed to supplement the incomes of ‘dangerously poor’ households through cash transfers and links to complementary services to enable them to reduce their degree of poverty.

Lessons identified from this emerging practice include the fact that cost and affordability can be high, even for targeted schemes, and a certain level of state capacity is needed to maximise impacts (e.g. in terms infrastructure and complementary services) (ODI/UNICEF 2009).

There is also growing experience in using cash transfers in a range of fragile settings (see Box 15). This experience points to the importance of targeting issues, particularly where conflict may reflect social divisions, with risks that this can exacerbate these divisions if not managed appropriately. There have been some efforts to focus on specific groups to defuse tension, as in Sierra Leone where public-works programmes were aimed at young men and ex-combatants, or in Nepal, where the government extended the cash-transfer programme to previously excluded minority groups (Holmes 2009). Some innovative delivery mechanisms have also included the use of remittance organisations and money-transfer companies (see Box 19).

### **Box 19: Cash-transfer programmes in conflict-affected countries**

- In Somalia, cash grants and cash-for-work projects have been implemented, delivered using remittance or money-transfer companies to minimise security risks. These were used to cover basic consumption needs, debt repayments and the purchase of livestock.

- In Afghanistan, the government National Rural Access Programme provided cash-for-work safety nets, with cash used for food and debt repayment. Money-transfer companies were also used as a delivery mechanism.

*Source: Holmes 2009*

### 4.3 Regional and sub-regional approaches

A key element in examining the provision of basic services in low-density countries, particularly in the Sahel region of West and Central Africa, is the challenge created by cross-border population movements. In the Sahel, nomadic pastoralists move relatively freely across national borders, where there is almost a complete absence of state control. This is highly relevant in Mali, which shares over 7,000km of remote desert borders with seven North and West African countries. When group identities are not strongly defined by an affiliation to a particular state, this raises the question of who should be responsible for serving their needs. Furthermore, food insecurity, conflict, and employment pressures affect migration, transitory, and settlement patterns and pose particular challenges for national governments.

Responses to these supra-national issues are likely to require integrated and cooperative approaches among neighbouring countries, although it is important to remain flexible regarding the ‘level’ at which effective interventions might make sense. Governance systems may take a regional, sub-regional, bilateral or even a micro-regional approach.

In the Sahel, cultural and historical alliances, regional and sub-regional politics and power structures, and informal dynamics give rise to a highly complex environment. Although current policy approaches tend to focus on regional-level engagement through formal regional groupings, such as the Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS), these may not always be the most appropriate institutions.

Formal regional institutions are not exempt from tensions and the level of national commitment to the implementation of regional integration policies remains unclear. For example, within ECOWAS there are different agendas and divergences of opinion between the West Africa Economic and Monetary Union (WAEMU) and non-WAEMU member states in many policy areas including in the handling of security threats facing the frontline Sahelian states (Burkina Faso, Mali and Niger) and in the desired location of physical infrastructure, such as roads. And within this Francophone sub-regional grouping, (WAEMU), there are powerful informal political dynamics at play. Moreover, concentrating on regional institutions may exclude from the analysis key stakeholders who will be essential to any policy reform process. For example, in the case of Mali, a West African regional analysis would exclude the role/ intervention of countries such as Algeria and Mauritania in North Africa and Chad in Central Africa.

In some cases sub-regional perspectives may provide more appropriate approaches to governance. Sub-regional groupings (or bilateral arrangements) can facilitate collaboration on shared national and cross-border issues and overcome the constraints associated with large regional organisations in which members are not equally affected by particular policy issues. Such approaches may be more appropriate, for example for information-sharing, funding purposes and for facilitating cross-border cooperation. For example the sub-regional institution Abidjan-Lagos Corridor (ALCO) runs a programme to support HIV-related interventions among vulnerable mobile populations along the Abidjan-Lagos transport corridor. The Organisation for the Development of the Senegal River, which includes Mali, Mauritania and Niger, is another example.

---

Elsewhere, micro-regional approaches, which can be facilitated by shared socio-cultural affiliations, may provide locally appropriate collaborative responses to cross-border issues. The Mano River Women's Peace Network (MARWOPNET) achieved considerable success in addressing serious security issues in the micro-regional, cross-border areas of the Liberia–Sierra Leone–Guinea sub-region, which had been affected by respective national conflicts.

In other cases supra-regional organisations, which can transcend regional groupings and address trans-regional concerns, may be more appropriate governance approaches. Two examples of trans-regional institutions addressing common issues facing their members include the Community of Sahel-Saharan states (CEN-SAD) whose membership spans North, West and Central Africa and includes countries such as Chad, Central African Republic, Egypt, Eritrea, Libya, Morocco, Sudan, Somalia and Tunisia, and the Permanent Interstate Committee for Drought Control in the Sahel (Comité permanent Inter-États de Lutte contre la Sécheress, CILSS), whose membership extends to Mauritania and Chad.

The line between national, sub-national and regional problems and their solutions is rarely clear-cut and there are often gaps between the formal roles of institutional bodies and the realities of cross-border and sub-regional dynamics.

---

# 5 Conclusions

This review has examined a range of international experience in delivering services in low-density contexts, in ways that have built trust between citizens and the state. As such, it has tried to look broadly at a wide range of experience, based on some shared contextual features, and to draw out some of the key lessons and insights.

Although it has focused on a number of features of innovation that seem to be significant – namely issues of mobility and proximity; of connectivity and new technologies; the use of hybrid arrangements; and forms of community reconstruction or community-driven development, – the review has also examined innovations in terms of systems of governance, including experiences of asymmetric decentralisation, fiscal equalisation and the targeting of marginalised or vulnerable groups.

One of the main conclusions that can be drawn from the review is that innovative mechanisms do not always work through government or government alone, and can often use a range of other types of governance models for service delivery, such as those favouring a strong role for community engagement and participation. In addition, innovative mechanisms are not always implemented through governance systems that rely on formally decentralised structures but rather on various hybrid governance arrangements that may or may not include some form of decentralisation or ‘de-concentration’. This main finding has important implications and questions some of the prevailing rationales for the promotion of decentralisation as a peace-building measure.

The next step is to map the relevance and feasibility of some of the features of innovation discussed above to the Sahelian context and specifically to Northern Mali. This is beyond the scope of this review, however, since it entails a thorough mapping and understanding of key contextual factors, and an assessment of the viability of a range of possible options. This will be the focus of further studies to be undertaken by the World Bank.

Some major issues and questions should inform this next phase, some of which were implicit in some of the discussion above, and would be likely require further exploration:

- First, while we sought to map a range of low-density contexts and to model definitions of low population density based on a range similar to that in the Sahel, we have not explored the significant variation in population density in Mali itself. As a result, the relative costs of delivering services – and of the costs and benefits of some of the programmes discussed in this report – will vary substantially. This will affect issues of fiscal equalisation, for instance, since providing the same level of financing to every region would not take such variation into account.
- Second, this report does not cover issues of national politics and incentives in depth, but we know that sparsely populated areas of countries can be seen as politically marginal; this will also affect issues of national prioritisation and

---

budget allocations. There will therefore be a need for strategies to facilitate the political will and incentives to draw on some of the examples highlighted in this report, and this could be another area of useful lessons from other contexts (although doing so goes beyond the scope of this review).

- Third, seasonality is of cross-cutting significance for many aspects of service delivery in a context like the Sahel. Across this region, there may be periods of the year where access is compromised, and this will have major implications for options to provide more mobile services, for instance. The above discussion touches on elements of this – for instance, attempts in the education sector which have tried to accommodate farming cycles or labour demands of herding as part of pastoral migration – but it will have broader implications for how and when some groups seek access to services.

This review identifies a range of programmes and delivery approaches, but does not look in depth at how these have evolved or are shaped by historical legacies. This should be another important dimension of any future analysis in Mali. For instance, since the 1990s Mali has experienced attempts to implement sweeping decentralisation programmes, with limited success. It would therefore be vital to understand how these reforms were implemented in the past, and some of the specific challenges they faced.

Indeed, one overriding lesson that links across all of the features identified in this review is the importance of starting with both a thorough understanding of context and of the main problems and needs on the ground. Such a mapping should aim to develop a far deeper understanding of the challenges Mali encounters than was possible in this review, and on this basis to identify the innovations that can offer the most useful lessons and insights. It should also point to a flexible approach to programming options – offering space for ‘learning by doing’ and iteration, in order to adapt programmes and delivery models to changing conditions on the ground.

To support this process, we summarise below some of the main features of innovation identified, and some of the main questions for contextual features and enabling conditions. This provides an indicative list of some of the principal points to consider, but would need to be further developed on the basis of a more in-depth mapping exercise.

**Table 1: Key innovation features**

Mobility	Connectivity	Practical hybrids	Community-driven reconstruction/ development
<b>Key context questions:</b>			
<p><i>What are the key service gaps that result from long distance? Are some groups more marginalised or harder to reach than others (other than geographic factors) and why? What is the scope for enforcement/regulation of more mobile services and by whom? What is the scope for communities to contribute to elements of provision (e.g. in terms of CHWs)? What are the main points of contact between citizens and the state? What is the scope for maximising these, e.g. through co-provision? What level of accessibility is possible? How does this change, e.g. by seasons?</i></p>	<p><i>How connected are existing networks and communities (e.g. through ICTs)? What are some of the main bottlenecks to greater connectivity (e.g. infrastructure, electricity access)? What are the main information gaps that different groups identify (in which sectors; what types of information)? How connected are service providers? What are the main barriers they face, for instance for peer learning and support? What are the main information gaps and asymmetries between users and providers? How well informed are providers of the needs and gaps of hard-to-reach communities? What is the scope for PPPs to address bottlenecks? What sorts of monitoring and oversight arrangements already exist and how well do they function?</i></p>	<p><i>What sorts of customary/ informal institutions already exist? What forms of resilience and social cohesion already exist? What power structures are embedded within these? What is the nature of the interaction between formal and informal institutions? What are the potential trade-offs or negative effects of hybrid arrangements? How might these be addressed?</i></p>	<p><i>What core needs do communities identify? Can pre-existing institutions be built upon or is there a new for new institutional arrangements? What relationships exist between and within different groups? How can stakeholders (especially marginalised groups) influence social processes? What sorts of dispute mechanisms already exist and how well do these work? What is the capacity of different groups for mobilisation and collective action? What might be some of the ongoing conflict risks (e.g. access to national resources, regional dynamics)? What is the scope for regional or sub-regional responses?</i></p>
<b>Useful examples include:</b>			
Nomadic Skills Training and Vocational Education Project, Nigeria	Mobile Technology for Health, Ghana	Franco-Arab, Islamic and madrassa schools in Niger and Mali	National Solidarity Programme, Afghanistan
School Health and Nutrition project, Eritrea	Distance learning, Kenya	Justice provision, Ghana	Community policing, Niger
BRAC community health promoters, South Sudan	Mpesa, Kenya	Education for nomadic populations, Mongolia	Mano River Women's Peace Network, Liberia–Sierra Leone–Guinea sub-region
Lady Health Workers Program, Pakistan	EpiSurveyor, Senegal	Aboriginal Head Start on Reserve, Canada	

---

**Cross-cutting questions:**

---

What are the main priorities and needs that the populations identify? What do they see as the key service delivery priorities and gaps?

How do different groups perceive the state?

What shapes these perceptions (e.g. historical legacies, recent experiences, personal interactions)?

What is the local distribution of power and resources and what shapes this (formally and informally)?

What has been the experience of past decentralisation reforms? How are these perceived and what are some of the main challenges identified?

What are the principal social and cultural processes shaping societies at the local level? How do these interact with state systems or processes (and how distant are they perceived to be from these)?

How do different groups perceive issues of fairness and justice – what grievances or divisions identified and why?

What is the capacity and capability of local state institutions, both in terms of service delivery and oversight of services?

What is the capacity and capability of non-state providers (private, not-for-profit, informal)?

What are the political motivations and incentives for service delivery and how might these shape processes and outcomes?

---



---

# References

- Abdikarim, S.M. and Velema, J.P. (1999) 'Where health care has no access: the nomadic populations of sub-Saharan Africa', *Tropical Medicine and International Health* 4(10): 695–707.
- Abramson, W. (2009) 'Contracting out Health Services in Post-Conflict and Fragile Situations: Lessons from Cambodia, Guatemala and Liberia', in OECD/AfDB, *Contracting Out Government Functions and Services: Emerging Lessons from Post-Conflict and Fragile Situations*. Paris: OECD Publishing. Available at: [http://www.keepeek.com/Digital-Asset-Management/oecd/development/contracting-out-government-functions-and-services/contracting-out-health-services-in-post-conflict-and-fragile-situations\\_9789264066212-2-en#page4](http://www.keepeek.com/Digital-Asset-Management/oecd/development/contracting-out-government-functions-and-services/contracting-out-health-services-in-post-conflict-and-fragile-situations_9789264066212-2-en#page4)
- AFD Projets de développement rurale: '[Tchad : Accompagner la transhumance et prévenir les conflits](#)'. AFD Website
- Aghali, A. (2013) 'Le bien sécurité dans trois communes (Guidan Roudji, Balleyara et Say) : des logiques de l'état aux logiques locales, ou la diversité des acteurs'. Etudes et travaux N° 105. Niamey: Laboratoire d'études de recherches sur les dynamiques sociales et le développement local (LASDEL).
- Aker, J. and Mbiti, I. (2010) 'Mobile phone and economic development in Africa'. Working Paper 211. London: Centre for Global Development.
- Aker, J. (2008) 'Does Digital Divide or Provide? The Impact of Cell Phones on Grain Markets in Niger'. Berkeley: University of California
- Ball, J. (2008) 'Promoting equity and dignity for aboriginal children in Canada', *IPPR Choices* 14 (7).
- Bano, M. (2011) 'Negotiating collaboration in Pakistan', *Public Administration and Development* 31(4): 262–272.
- Barclay, E. and Scott, J. (2013) 'Australia', in Nalla, M.K. and Newman, G.R. (eds) *Community policing in indigenous communities*. Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press.
- Beath, A., Christia, F. and Enikolopov, R. (2013) 'Randomised Impact Evaluation of Afghanistan's National Solidarity Programme'. Afghanistan: National Solidarity Programme. Available at: <http://www.nsp-ie.org/reports/finalreport.pdf>
- Blöchliger, H. and Charbit, C. (2008) 'Fiscal Equalisation'. OECD Economic Studies No. 44, 2008/1. Available at: <http://www.oecd.org/eco/42506135.pdf>
- Booth, D. (2012) *Development as a Collective Action Problem: Addressing the Real Challenges of African Governance*. London: ODI/Africa Power and Politics.

---

Available at: <http://www.institutions-africa.org/filestream/20121024-appp-synthesis-report-development-as-a-collective-action-problem>

BRAC (2012) South Sudan Annual Report, BRAC South Sudan, Available at: <http://www.brac.net/sites/default/files/ar2012/BRAC%20South%20Sudan.pdf>

Catley, A., Leyland, T., Mariner, J.C., Akabwai, D.M.O., Admassu, B., Asfaw, W., Bekele, G. and Hassan, S.H. (2004) 'Para-veterinary professionals and the development of quality, self-sustaining community-based services', *Scientific and Technical Review, World Organisation for Animal health (OIE)* 23(1): 225–252.

Chauvet, L., Gubert, F., Mercier, M. and Mesplé-Somps, S. (2013) 'Migrants home town associations and local development in Mali'. Paris: Institut de recherche et développement (IRD)

Clairmont, D. (2013) 'Canada: Aboriginal', in Nalla, M.K. and Newman, G.R. (eds) *Community policing in indigenous communities*. Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press.

Conyers, D. (2007) 'Decentralisation and service delivery: Lessons from sub-Saharan Africa', *IDS Bulletin* 38, No1 (p18-32)

Crook, R.C. (2003) 'Decentralisation and poverty reduction in Africa: The politics of central–local relations', *Public Administration and Development* 23(1): 77–88.

Crook, R., Asante, K., and Brobberry, V. (2010) 'Popular concepts of justice and fairness in Ghana: testing the legitimacy of new or hybrid forms of state justice'. APPP Working Paper 14. London: Africa Power and Politics Programme. Available at: <http://www.institutions-africa.org/filestream/20101026-appp-working-paper-14-crook-et-al-popular-concepts-of-justice-fairness-in-ghana-oct-2010>

Crook, R.C. (2011) 'The state and accessible justice in Africa: is Ghana unique?'. APPP Policy Brief 3. London: Africa Power and Politics Programme. Available at: <http://www.institutions-africa.org/filestream/20111115-appp-policy-brief-3-the-state-and-accessible-justice-in-africa-is-ghana-unique-richard-crook-nov-2011>

Denney, L. and Jenkins, S. (2013) 'Securing communities: the what and the how of community policing'. Background Paper. London: Overseas Development Institute. Available at: <http://www.odi.org.uk/publications/7633-community-policing>

Mukerjee, D. and Rahim, M. (2013) 'Afghanistan: Police e mardumi, Indigenous Civilian Policing at District level', in Nalla, M.K. and Newman, G.R. *Community Policing in Indigenous Communities*. Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press.

Domingo, P. and Wild, L. (2012) 'Will Kenya's 2010 Constitution work for women and children?' ODI Project Briefing No 74. London: Overseas Development Institute. Available at: <http://www.odi.org.uk/publications/6577-kenya-constitution-women-children>

Egeimi, O. Abdel Mahmood, M. and Abdella, A.M. (2003) 'SOS Sahel's experience of conflict transformation between pastoralists and farmers at El Ain, North Kordofan State, Sudan: Towards a local peace'. Securing the Commons N°5. London: Institute for Environment and Development (IIED).

Farm Africa (2001) 'Farmer Participatory Research in Southern Ethiopia: The Experiences of the Farmers' Research Project'. London: FARM-Africa

Fearon, J., Humphreys, M. and Weinstein, J. (2008) *Community-Driven Reconstruction in Lofa County. Impact Assessment*. New York: Columbia University.

- 
- Gavrilis, G. (2010) 'The Good and Bad News about Afghan Opium'. New York: Council on Foreign Relations. Available at: <http://www.cfr.org/afghanistan/good-bad-news-afghan-opium/p21372>
- Ghani, A. and Lockhart, C. (2006) 'Writing The History Of The Future: Securing Stability through Peace Agreements'. Washington, DC: The Institute for State Effectiveness.
- Ghani, S. and Bizhan, N. (2009) 'Contracting out Core Government Functions and Services in Afghanistan', in OECD/AfDB, *Contracting Out Government Functions and Services: Emerging Lessons from Post-Conflict and Fragile Situations*. Paris: OECD Publishing. Available at: [http://www.keepeek.com/Digital-Asset-Management/oecd/development/contracting-out-government-functions-and-services\\_9789264066212-en#page99](http://www.keepeek.com/Digital-Asset-Management/oecd/development/contracting-out-government-functions-and-services_9789264066212-en#page99)
- Guerrero, A. (2011) *Rebuilding Trust in Government via Service Delivery: The Case of Medellin, Colombia*, Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Hesse, C., Anderson, S., Cotula, L., Skinner, J. and Toulmin, C. (2013) 'Building climate resilience in the Sahel'. Paper presented to the DFID Consultation workshop on Building Resilience in the Sahel and planned Building Resilience and Adaptation to Climate Extremes and Disasters (BRACED) Programme, 17 July. London: International Institute for Environment and Development (IIED). Available at: <http://pubs.iied.org/pdfs/G03650.pdf>
- Hofman, B., Kadjatmiko, K. K. and Sjahrir, B. S. (2006) 'Evaluating Fiscal Equalization in Indonesia'. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 3911. Washington, DC: World Bank. Available at: <http://www1.worldbank.org/publicsector/decentralization/decentralizationcorecourse2006/OtherReadings/HofmanEtAl.pdf>
- Holmes, R. (2009) 'Cash transfers in post-conflict contexts'. ODI Project Briefing No 32. London: Overseas Development Institute. Available at: <http://www.odi.org.uk/sites/odi.org.uk/files/odi-assets/publications-opinion-files/4608.pdf>
- Holmes, R. (2011) 'The Role of Social Protection Programmes in Supporting Education in Conflict-affected Situations'. Background paper prepared for the Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2011, *The hidden crisis: Armed conflict and education*. Available at: <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0019/001913/191354e.pdf>
- IIED 'Shared management of common property resources in the Sahel, A regional action research programme: 1999-2002 Final Report'. London: Institute for Environment and Development (IIED).
- ILRI News (22/06/2011) 'Virtual Kenya' web platform launched today: User-friendly interactive maps for charting human and environmental health, Press release, Kenya: International Livestock Research Institute
- Kelleher, F. (2007) 'Reaching nomadic communities: Providing inclusive quality education' in Commonwealth Secretariat (2007) *Commonwealth Education Partnerships 2007* London: Commonwealth Secretariat
- Kooy, M. and Wild, L. (2012) 'Tearfund WASH service delivery in South Sudan: contributions to peacebuilding and state building'. London: Overseas Development Institute. Available at: <http://www.odi.org.uk/publications/7331-wash-conflict-water-fragile>

- 
- Krätli, S. (2001) 'Education provision to Nomadic pastoralists. A literature review'. IDS Working Paper 126. Brighton: Institute of Development Studies.
- Ilkjaer, L. (2013) 'Niger', in Nalla, M.K. and Newman, G.R. (eds) *Community Policing in Indigenous Communities*. Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press.
- Loevinsohn, B. and Sayed, G. D. (2008) 'Lessons from the health sector in Afghanistan: How progress can be made in challenging circumstances', *JAMA* 300(6): 724–726.
- Mansuri, G. and Rao, V. (2012) *Localizing Development: Does Participation Work?* Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Marc, A., Willman, A., Aslam, G. and Rebosio, M. with Balasuriya, K. (2013) *Societal Dynamics and Fragility – Engaging Societies in Responding to Fragile Situations*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Ndegwa, S. N. (2002) Decentralization in Africa: A Stocktaking Survey. Africa Region Working Paper Series N°40. Washington: World Bank Group
- ODI/UNICEF (2009) 'Child poverty: a role for cash transfers in West and Central Africa?' Joint Briefing Paper. Available at: <http://www.odi.org.uk/sites/odi.org.uk/files/odi-assets/publications-opinion-files/4565.pdf>
- Olivier de Sardan, J.-P. (2009) 'The eight modes of local governance in West Africa'. APPP Working Paper 4. London: Africa Power and Politics Programme. Available at <http://www.institutions-africa.org/filestream/20110208-appp-working-paper-4-the-eight-modes-of-local-governance-in-west-africa-olivier-de-sardan-nov-2009>
- Olivier de Sardan, J.-P. (2012a) 'Providing public goods : local responses to state failure in Niger'. APPP Policy Brief 4. London: Africa Power and Politics Programme. Available at <http://www.institutions-africa.org/filestream/20120112-appp-policy-brief-4-providing-public-goods-local-responses-to-policy-incoherence-and-state-failure-in-niger-jean-pierre-olivier-de-sardan-january-2012>
- Olivier de Sardan, J.-P. (2012b) 'Local Governance: the delivery of four public goods in three municipalities of Niger (Phase 2 synthesis)'. APPP Working Paper No. 21. London: Africa Power and Politics Programme. Available at: <http://www.institutions-africa.org/filestream/20120619-local-governance-the-delivery-of-four-public-goods-in-three-municipalities-of-niger>
- Olivier de Sardan, J.-P. (2011) 'Gouvernance locale la délivrance de quatre biens publics dans trois communes nigériennes'. LASDEL Etudes et Travaux No. 5. Niamey: LASDEL. Available at: <http://www.institutions-africa.org/filestream/20120216-appp-working-paper-21-gouvernance-locale-la-delivrance-de-quatre-biens-publics-dans-trois-communes-nigeriennes-jp-olivier-de-sardan-fev-2012>
- Osifasan W. (2011) *Strengthening State–society Relations in Fragile Contexts*. London: HelpAge International.
- Ouedraogo, H.M.G. (2003) 'Decentralisation and local governance: Experiences from francophone West Africa', *Public Administration and Development* 23: 97–103.
- Ratsimbazafy, J. (2013) 'Madagascar', in Nalla, M.K. and Newman, G.R. (eds) *Community Policing in Indigenous Communities*. Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press.
- Reid, F. (2013) Reaching 'in' remote technologies and service delivery in rural and remote communities. Canberra: National Rural Health Advice

- 
- Lester, R., Ritvo, P., Mills, E.J., Kariri, A., Karanja, S., Chung, M.H., Jack, W., Habyarimana, J., Sadatsafavi, M., Najafzadeh, M., Marra, C.A., Estambale, B., Ngugi, E., Blake Ball, T., Thabane, L., Gelmon, L. J., Kimani, J., Ackers, M. and Plummer, F.A. (2010) 'Effects of a mobile phone short message service on antiretroviral treatment adherence in Kenya (WelTel Kenya1): a randomised trial', *The Lancet* 376(9755):1838–1845.
- République du Mali (2012) Etude sur les stratégies de développement économique et social des régions nord du Mali (Tombouctou, Gao et Kidal). Présidence de la République, Programme spécial pour la paix, la sécurité et le développement dans le Nord du Mali (PSPSDN)
- Robinson, M. (2007) 'Does decentralisation improve equity and efficiency in public service delivery provision?', *IDS Bulletin* 38(1) p1-17.
- Rocha Menocal, A. (2007) 'Colombia: Power and Change Analysis', Report to the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Embassy in Guatemala, Guatemala City.
- Rodríguez Pose, R. and Samuels, F. (2011) 'Progress in health in Eritrea: Cost-effective inter-sectoral interventions and a long-term perspective'. Development Progress Story. London: Overseas Development Institute.
- Sandford, S. (1978) 'Welfare and wanderers: the organisation of social services for pastoralists', *ODI Review* A11(1):70–87.
- Sansom, K. (2011) 'Complementary roles? NGO–government relations for community-based sanitation in South Asia', *Public Administration and Development* 31(4): 282–294.
- Shar, A. (2006) 'A Practitioner's Guide to Intergovernmental Fiscal Transfers'. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 4039. Washington, DC: World Bank. Available at: <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTDEBTDEPT/Resources/468980-1207588563500/4864698-1207775351512/WPS4039.pdf>
- Siele, D., Swift, J. and Krätli, S. (2011) 'Reaching pastoralists with formal education a distance learning strategy for Kenya'. Paper presented at the International Conference of the Future of Pastoralism, Futures Agricultural Consortium, Addis Ababa, 21–23 March.
- Söderbaum, F. and Taylor, I. (eds) (2007) 'Micro-Regionalism in West Africa Evidence from Two Case Studies'. Discussion Paper 34. Uppsala: Nordiska Afrikainstitutet.
- Söderbaum, F. and Taylor, I. (eds) (2008) 'Afro-Regions: The Dynamics of Cross-Border Micro-Regionalism in Africa'. Uppsala: Nordiska Afrikainstitutet.
- Strand, A., Toje, H., Morten Jerve, A., and Samset, I. (2003) 'Community-driven development in contexts of conflict: Concept Paper commissioned by ESSD, World Bank'. Bergen: Chr. Michelsen Institute.
- Tearfund (2010) 'Adoption of community-led total sanitation (CLTS): Guidance for programming of CLTS in Tearfund-supported projects'. London: Tearfund.
- Thomson, A. and Clairmont, D. (2013) 'Canada: The Annapolis Valley', in Nalla, M.K. and Newman, G.R. (eds) *Community policing in indigenous communities*. Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press.
- Tilley, H. (2012) *Unblocking results Case study: Rural Water in Tanzania*. London: Overseas Development Institute. Available at: <http://www.odi.org.uk/sites/odi.org.uk/files/odi-assets/publications-opinion-files/8411.pdf>

- 
- Trémolières, M. (2007) 'Regionalism in the Sahel: The Mopti-Ouahigouya cross-border area', in Söderbaum, F. and I. Taylor (eds), 'Micro-Regionalism in West Africa Evidence from Two Case Studies'. Discussion Paper 34. Uppsala: Nordiska Afrikainstitutet.
- Trémolières, M. and Abdoul, M. (2007) 'Cross-border area cooperation between Niger and Nigeria: The case of the Maradi Micro-region', in Söderbaum, F. and I. Taylor (eds), 'Micro-Regionalism in West Africa Evidence from Two Case Studies'. Discussion Paper 34. Uppsala: Nordiska Afrikainstitutet.
- UNICEF-Mauritania (2009) 'The Rapid SMS experience in 2009 nutrition survey in Mauritania', *Focus N° 3*, March 2011. UNICEF Working Document series.
- UNICEF-Somalia (1993) Strategies on nomadic education delivery: state of the art review, UNICEF Somalia/ UNDOCS DOCUMENTATION UNIT.
- USIP (undated) 'Afghanistan: Life Beyond Poppies'. Washington, DC: United States Institute for Peace. Available at: <http://peacemedia.usip.org/resource/afghanistan-life-beyond-poppies-%E2%80%93-development-pictures>
- Van Campenhout, B. (2012) Mobile Apps to Deliver Extension to Remote Areas: Preliminary Results from Mnt Elgon Area. Washington: Grameen Foundation
- Vervisch, T., Titeca, K. Vlassenroot, K. and Braeckman, J. (2013) 'Social capital and post-conflict reconstruction in Burundi: The limits of community-based reconstruction', *Development and Change* 44(1): 147–174.
- Villalón, L.A., Idrissa, A. et Bodian, M. (2012a) 'Religion, demande sociale et réformes éducatives au Mali'. APPP Research Report 7. London: Africa Power and Politics Programme.
- Villalón, L.A., Idrissa, A. et Bodian, M. (2012b) 'Religion, demande sociale et réformes éducatives au Niger'. APPP Research Report 6. London: Africa Power and Politics Programme.
- Villalón, L.A. and Tidjani-Alou, M. (2012) 'Religion and education reform in Africa: Harnessing religious values to developmental ends'. APPP Policy Brief 7. London: Africa Power and Politics Programme.
- Wong, S. (2012) *What Have Been the Impacts of World Bank Community-Driven Development Programs?* Washington, DC: World Bank, Social Development Department.
- World Bank 'Mauritania: School Feeding as a Tool to Improve Access to and Quality of Education in the Most Impoverished Regions'. Available at: <http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/NEWS/0,,contentMDK:22714149~menuPK:141310~pagePK:34370~piPK:34424~theSitePK:4607,00.html>
- World Health Organization (WHO) (2011) Health: New Horizons for Health through Mobile Technologies. Global Observatory for Health Series, 3. Geneva: WHO.
- Wunsch, A.S. (2013) 'Analyzing self-organised local governance initiatives: are there insights for decentralization reforms', *Public Administration and Development* 33: 221–235.
- Yilmaz, S., Vaillancourt, F. and d, B. (2012) 'State and local governments: Why they matter and how to finance them in Ed', R.D. and Petersen, J.E. (2012) "The Handbook of State and Local Government Finance. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press

# Appendix 1: Matrix of countries for selection

Population density: No of people per square km of land

AFRICA		
Country Name	Area	2011
Namibia	3	
Mauritania	3	
Botswana	4	
Libya	4	
Gabon	6	
Central African Republic	7	
Chad	9	
Congo, Rep.	12	
Niger	13	
Mali	13	
Algeria	15	
Somalia	15	
Angola	16	
Zambia	18	
Sudan	19	
Equatorial Guinea	26	
Congo, Dem. Rep.	30	
Mozambique	30	
Zimbabwe	33	
Madagascar	37	
Djibouti	39	
Guinea	42	
South Africa	42	
Cameroon	42	
Liberia	43	
Tanzania	52	
Eritrea	54	
Guinea-Bissau	55	
Burkina Faso	62	
Swaziland	62	
Cote d'Ivoire	63	
Senegal	66	
Tunisia	69	
Lesotho	72	
Morocco	72	
Kenya	73	
Benin	81	
Egypt, Arab Rep.	83	
Sierra Leone	84	
Ethiopia	85	
Ghana	110	
Togo	113	
Cape Verde	124	
Malawi	163	
Uganda	173	
Gambia, The	176	
Nigeria	178	
Seychelles	187	

ASIA		
Country Name	Area	2011
Mongolia	2	
Kazakhstan	6	
Russian Federation	9	
Turkmenistan	11	
Bhutan	19	
Lao PDR	27	
Kyrgyz Republic	29	
Afghanistan	54	
Myanmar	74	
French Polynesia	75	
Timor-Leste	79	
Cambodia	81	
Malaysia	88	
Indonesia	134	
Thailand	136	
China	144	
Korea, Dem. Rep.	203	
Nepal	213	
Pakistan	229	
Vietnam	283	

PACIFIC ISLANDS		
Country Name	Area	2011
New Caledonia	14	
Papua New Guinea	15	
Solomon Islands	20	
Vanuatu	20	
Palau	45	
Fiji	48	
Samoa	65	
French Polynesia	75	
Kiribati	125	
Northern Mariana Is.	133	
Tonga	145	
Micronesia, Fed. Sts.	159	
Marshall Islands	305	
Tuvalu	328	
Guam	337	
American Samoa	348	

LATIN AMERICA		
Country Name	Area	2011
Suriname	3	
Guyana	4	
Bolivia	9	
Argentina	15	
Belize	16	
Paraguay	17	
Uruguay	19	
Peru	23	
Chile	23	
Brazil	23	
Venezuela, RB	33	
Colombia	42	
Panama	48	
Nicaragua	49	
Mexico	59	
Ecuador	59	
Cuba	106	
Guatemala	138	

MIDDLE EAST		
Country Name	Area	2011
Oman	9	
Saudi Arabia	13	
Iran, Islamic Re.	46	
Yemen, Rep.	47	
Jordan	70	
Iraq	76	
United Arab Em.	94	
Armenia	109	
Syrian Arab Rep.	113	
Kuwait	158	
Qatar	161	
Israel	359	
Lebanon	416	
West Bank and	652	
Bahrain	1741	

OTHER COUNTRIES OF INTEREST		
Country Name	Area	2011
Greenland	Europe	0
Australia	Australasia	3
Iceland	Europe	3
Canada	North America	4
Oman	Middle East	9
Saudi Arabia	Middle East	13
Norway	Europe	16
New Zealand	Australasia	17
Caribbean small states	North America	17
Finland	Europe	18
Sweden	Europe	23
Estonia	Europe	32
Latvia	Europe	33
United States	North America	34
Bahamas, The	North America	35

Selection criteria		
Affected by conflict or insecurity		
Presence of indigenous populations		
Presence of nomadic populations		
Selected countries		
Countries of specific interest		
Countries which have specific regions of low density of potential		



# Appendix 2: List of examples

Social services - Education					
Country Region	Title	Nomadic or mobile pops.	Socio- econ. diversity <sup>7</sup>	Conflict affected	Population density
Canada	<a href="#">Aboriginal head start programmes (AHP)</a>		x		4
DRC North Kivu	<a href="#">CONCERN Emergency Assistance programme</a>			x	30
Kenya North	SAKA Boarding Schools	x			73
Kenya North	Nomadic education reforms	x			73
Mali	<a href="#">Education reforms</a>		x		13
Mauritania	<a href="#">School feeding programme</a>	x			3
Mongolia	Various	x			2
Niger	<a href="#">Education reforms</a>		x		13
Nigeria Kaduna	<a href="#">Nomadic Skills Training and Vocational Education Project (STVEP)</a>	x			178
Pakistan	School feeding programmes		x		229
Somalia	Rural development campaign	x			15

<sup>7</sup> Indigenous, ethnic or religious diversity



South Sudan	<a href="#">BRAC Education programme</a>			x	19 <sup>8</sup>
Uganda <i>Karamoja</i>	Oxfam unconditional cash transfers	x		x	173
Uganda <i>Samburu</i>	Lchekuti Out-of-school programme (OOS)	x			173
<b>Social services - Health</b>					
<b>Country Region</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Nomadic or mobile pops.</b>	<b>Socio- econ. diversity</b>	<b>Conflict affected</b>	<b>Population density</b>
Afghanistan	Basic package of health services			x	54
Australia	<a href="#">Rural in reach</a>		x		3
Australia	<a href="#">Health Education Reaching Blokes (HERB)</a>		x		3
Eritrea	Inter-sectoral School, Health and Nutrition Project (SHNP)		x	x	54
Ghana <i>Rural</i>	<a href="#">Mobile technology for health (MOTech)</a>		x		110
Ghana <i>Rural</i>	<a href="#">Mobile Doctors Network (MDNet)</a>		x		110
Kenya	Mobile phone use and adherence to ARV treatments	x			73
Liberia	Ministry of Health and Social Welfare health reform programme			x	
Mauritania	<a href="#">Rapid SMS</a>	x	x		3
Nepal <i>Rural</i>	Community facilitators			x	213
Niger	'Extra pennies scheme'	x			13
Pakistan <i>Rural</i>	<a href="#">Lady health workers</a>		x		229

<sup>8</sup> Figures for Sudan

Senegal	Ministry of Health's use of EpiSurveyor to collect health data		x		66
South Africa	<a href="#">Mama South Africa</a>		x		42
South Sudan	<a href="#">BRAC – Community health workers (CWHs)</a>			x	19 <sup>2</sup>
<b>Social services - Water and Sanitation</b>					
<b>Country Region</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Nomadic or mobile pops.</b>	<b>Socio-econ. diversity</b>	<b>Conflict affected</b>	<b>Population density</b>
Afghanistan <i>Surkh</i>	<a href="#">Community-Led Total Sanitation (CLTS)</a>			x	54
Chad	The 'abre de palabre' system	x		x	9
Mali	Remittances from Home Town Associations in France		x		13
Pakistan <i>Rural</i>	<a href="#">Orangi Pilot Project Research and Training</a>		x		229
Tanzania <i>Rural</i>	<a href="#">Water Sector Development Programme (WSDP)</a>		x		52
<b>Governance and security (Community policing/justice)</b>					
<b>Country Region</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Nomadic or mobile pops.</b>	<b>Socio-econ. diversity</b>	<b>Conflict affected</b>	<b>Population density</b>
Afghanistan	Indigenous civilian policing pilot (Police e Maddumi)			x	54
Australia	Indigenous community night patrols		x		3
Canada <i>Annapolis Valley, Nova Scotia</i>	Community-based policing		x		4
Canada <i>Elsipogtog (First nation community)</i>	Elsipogtog community-based policing		x		4

Ghana <i>Rural</i>	Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice (CHRAJ)- ADR mediation		x		110
Madagascar	Fokonolona		x		37
Niger <i>Balleyara</i>	Patrols to manage seasonal migration of transhumants	x			13
Niger <i>Tahoua</i>	Community policing	x			13
<b>Markets and employment (livelihoods, agriculture, banking...)</b>					
<b>Country Region</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Nomadic or mobile pops.</b>	<b>Socio-econ. diversity</b>	<b>Conflict affected</b>	<b>Population density</b>
Afghanistan	<a href="#">National solidarity programme</a>			x	54
Columbia	Medellín reforms		x		
DRC	<i>De facto</i> power-sharing arrangements at the provincial level		x		30
Ethiopia	Shared Management of common property resources (SMCPR)	x		x	42
Indonesia <i>Rural</i>	SCRAPS Community reconstruction programme			x	134
Kenya <i>North</i>	<a href="#">HelpAge International Hunger Safety Net Programme (HSNP)</a>			x	73
Kenya <i>North</i>	<a href="#">Community Health Animal Workers</a>	x			73
Kenya <i>Rural</i>	Using <a href="#">EpiCollect</a> to track livestock health				73
Liberia	IRC Community-Driven Reconstruction			x	43
Niger	Shared Management of common property resources (SMCPR)	x			13
Niger	Mobile phone use and grain markets		x		13

---

Sudan	Shared Management of common property resources (SMCPR)	x	x	19 <sup>2</sup>
Uganda <i>North</i>	<a href="#">Community Knowledge Worker programme</a>	x		173
Uganda <i>North</i>	<a href="#">Community Health Animal Workers</a>	x		173

---



ODI is the UK's leading independent think tank on international development and humanitarian issues.

Our mission is to inspire and inform policy and practice which lead to the reduction of poverty, the alleviation of suffering and the achievement of sustainable livelihoods.

We do this by locking together high-quality applied research, practical policy advice and policy-focused dissemination and debate.

We work with partners in the public and private sectors, in both developing and developed countries.

---

Readers are encouraged to reproduce material from ODI Reports for their own publications, as long as they are not being sold commercially. As copyright holder, ODI requests due acknowledgement and a copy of the publication. For online use, we ask readers to link to the original resource on the ODI website. The views presented in this paper are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily represent the views of ODI.

© Overseas Development Institute 2013. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial Licence (CC BY-NC 3.0).

ISSN: 2052-7209

**Overseas Development Institute**  
**203 Blackfriars Road**  
**London SE1 8NJ**  
**Tel +44 (0)20 7922 0300**  
**Fax +44 (0)20 7922 0399**